



# City of Richmond

City Hall  
900 East Broad Street

## Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

---

Tuesday, October 24, 2017

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

---

### BEGINNING AT 3:30 P.M.

#### Call to Order

Mr. Klaus called the meeting to order at 3:30 pm.

#### Roll Call

**Present --** 8 - \* David C. Cooley, \* Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, \* Sanford Bond, \* Bryan Green,  
\* James W. Klaus, \* Andrew Ray McRoberts, \* Joseph Yates and \* Neville C.  
Johnson Jr.

**Absent --** 1 - \* Gerald Jason Hendricks

#### Approval of Minutes

August 22, 2017

**A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that the August minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green,  
James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

**Abstain --** 1 - Andrew Ray McRoberts

September 26, 2017

The September minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

October 10, 2017 (Quarterly Meeting)

The October quarterly meeting minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

#### Request to Modify a City Old and Historic District

[OHD-02-2017](#) 1201 East Clay - Amendment of White House of the Confederacy Old &  
Historic District

**Attachments:** [Request for Amendment of White House of the Confederacy Old &  
Historic District](#)  
[Site Map](#)

Ms. Pitts informed the Commission that this item has been withdrawn from the agenda at

the request of the applicant, and will return at a later date.

## Other Business

### Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts updated the Commission on an appeal that was received for the application for 101 North 29th Street, explaining the request and the appeal process.

Ms. Pitts also updated the Commission on the status of the change to the appointment of the vacant Commission seat, explaining that the process had been delayed and staff has decided to introduce an ordinance rather than waiting for a Councilmember to do so.

### Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts presented the new administrative approval report and explained that the program used to generate it is not as flexible and there are limitations to the information that can be displayed. Ms. Pitts also stated that staff is working to determine how the reports can be improved. The Commission commented generally on the information that would be helpful to see in the reports that was missing.

### Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries stated that staff has been following up with some built projects to correct issues and ensure compliance with approvals. She added that staff has also been working with the Code Enforcement division on some outstanding issues. Ms. Jeffries then shared that there has recently been some movement on two long term violations, specifically two corner stores located in Union Hill.

### Other Committee Reports

Mr. Green updated the Commission on items recently reviewed by the Urban Design Committee. He stated that the Committee has reviewed the proposed changes to the Checker's House in Monroe Park as well as new city street lighting for Manchester. Mr. Green also informed the Commission that an updated plan for the Allen Avenue median is expected by next month.

### \*\*\*Please Note\*\*\*

**Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.**

**BEGINNING AT 4:00 PM**

## CONSENT AGENDA

**A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that the Consent Agenda be approved with conditions. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.**

- 1 [COA-024581-2017](#) 604 North 1st Street - Construct wood fence with brick piers around the rear yard.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the design of the proposed gate be a simple wood gate rather than the metal gate proposed, the design to be administratively reviewed by staff and a separate application for the shed be submitted for Commission review. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 2 [COA-24478-2017](#) 2800 Patterson Avenue - Convert existing window to a door for roof access.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the window head height be maintained; the window being removed be maintained on site; and the door color be administratively reviewed by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 4 [COA-024471-2017](#) 2107 Cedar Street - Construct a new garage.

**Attachments:** [Applications and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: an alternate garage door design, that does not include arched windows, be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval and details of any new paving material or modifications to the existing privacy fence be submitted to staff for administrative review. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

- 8 [COA-024481-2017](#) 2007 Venable Street - Expand rear second story porch.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: details of the proposed railing be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval and the new structure and repaired porch be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements the main structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

- 3 [COA-24459-2017](#) 508 St. James Street - Renovate for 4 dwelling units, construct elevator shaft in rear.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by McRoberts, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the brick for the addition not be toothed into the existing brick to differentiate the new construction; the brick color be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the final design of the proposed picket fence be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the fence be painted or opaquely stained a color to be administratively approved by staff; the work be performed in conformance with a Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval; up to three outdoor mechanical units be located on the north side of the structure with the remaining units located on the roof in location as to not be visible from the public right of way; and the elevator shaft not project above the roof eave. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

- 5 [COA-024475-2017](#) 2235 Monument Avenue - Replace front entrance landing.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Lois Holloran, the applicant, came forward to answer questions. She stated that they wished to remove the tile on the landing and save it for any future repairs to the upper patios, which have the same tile but are in much better condition. The Commission

discussed generally how the tile could not be effectively removed and reinstalled but could potentially be salvaged for future repairs.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that as this area is most visible to the public she would be more supportive of a new tile, rather than the proposed limestone. Mr. Bond and Mr. Yates agreed, stating that limestone was not appropriate. Mr. Yates stated that the tile was an unusual art deco pattern and a suitable replacement tile could probably be located. The applicant responded that limestone was chosen to match other homes on Monument adding that the condo association had extensively researched tiles and were unable to locate a suitable replacement tile.

Mr. Cooley commented that he does not care for limestone, but agreed that the tile would be hard to match. He then suggested granite.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor suggested recreating the scale and pattern of the existing tile, perhaps in a different material.

**A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to explore a different design and material for the front landing that more closely matches the scale of the existing tile. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

**6** [COA-024476-2017](#) 2200 East Broad Street - Replace second story front door.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Jeremy Williams, the applicant, came forward to answer questions. He stated that the existing door is in poor condition due to deferred maintenance and has been modified. He explained that if a custom door is approved also creating a custom transom would be too costly and he wishes to install a new door which is 36 inches wide where the existing door is 42 inches wide. The Commission discussed generally the unusual dimensions of the door and the uncertainty regarding how the frame would be trimmed out to reduce the size of the opening for a smaller door.

Mr. Green commented that this was likely originally the primary entrance to the home, and the door is very old. He then stated that the Guidelines recommend preserving existing fabric.

Mr. Cooley stated that it won't be easy to trim the masonry opening which is 52 inches by 96 inches to create a functional opening.

Mr. Klaus commented that he would rather have the applicant install a custom door than restore the transom.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that there is evidence that the door is beyond repair.

Mr. Johnson, Jr. inquired if the original door and opening should be recreated. Mr. Yates replied that it should, as there is photographic evidence of what existed.

Mr. Klaus made a motion to approve the application with staff's recommendations, to install a door that matches the design and proportion of the door seen in the historic photographs. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor offered an amendment to the motion that the original door remain on site.

Mr. Jeremy Williams, the applicant, then withdrew the application.

**This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn**

- 9 [COA-024500-2017](#) 8 East Main Street - Construct second story addition on existing 1-story carriage house.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by Bond, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: applicant submit revised floor plans which are consistent with the elevations for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed fence be submitted for administrative review and approval; and paint and material colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

- 10 [COA-024587-2017](#) 2226 Monument Avenue - Construct a new front porch.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by Green, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the revised elevation presented at the meeting for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 6 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

**Recused --** 2 - Sanford Bond and Joseph Yates

- 11 [COA-024787-2017](#) 712 North 27th Street - Construct two story porch at the rear.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the porch structure be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure and the colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the proposed wooden French doors be true or simulated divided lite to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; and the upper porch project 4' into the rear yard instead of the proposed 6'. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

- 12 [COA-021096A](#) 812 Jessamine Street - Rehabilitate exterior of home, add 2nd story to rear addition.  
[-2017](#)

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as presented with the revised elevations to include the existing chimney for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded; paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; and the windows be wood or aluminum clad wood windows. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 7 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

**Abstain --** 1 - Bryan Green

## **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

- 13 [COA-024730-](#) 2710 East Clay - Construct a two-story rear addition.  
[2017](#)

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made multiple inquiries regarding the proposed materials. Ms. Emily Lacroix, the applicant, responded that the canopy would be metal, the door would be aluminum clad, the railing would be metal rods, and the cladding material was still undecided.

Mr. Bond commented that the fenestration pattern was unusual and suggested that the windows be aligned with the joints of the panels, which will be visible. He added that he liked the modern design but felt the unfinished wood siding was unusual.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented on the new window sizes and proportions, adding that the proposed new window openings on the second floor in the existing masonry are

required for egress, but they are not required on the first floor.

Mr. Yates commented that he appreciated the modern design, and questioned the proposed new openings in the historic masonry structure. Mr. Klaus suggested that only the two openings furthest from the street be created to minimize visibility.

Ms. Lacroix asked the Commission for suggestions regarding materials. The Commission suggested vertical cedar boards with a dark stain, corten steel panels, zinc panels, terra cotta panels, or rain screen. Mr. Green also stated that clear finished wood typically does not age well and suggested simple materials are best.

**This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed**

- 14 [COA-024487-2017](#) 2108 1/2 East Broad Street - Construct a new three-story single family home.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Dave Johannas, the applicant, came forward to answer questions about the project. Mr. Johannas explained that the proposed setbacks follow the pattern on the block, as well as the paired windows and the materials chosen. He asked the Commission for comments regarding the form and mass of the structure.

Mr. Bond commented that this project would be a good opportunity for a more modern design.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that she has concerns with another three story building on the block, inquiring if the building could be lowered. She agreed that the design could be more modern. Mr. Klaus also agreed that the design could be modern, and did not have to mimic historic architecture.

Mr. Bond commented that he is not concerned with the height, and inquired if the proposal met zoning requirements. Mr. Johannas replied that it did in terms of height.

Mr. Green commented that he is supportive of the proposed design, adding that he does have an issue with the height and suggested an English basement with two stories above. Mr. McRoberts agreed, stating that he likes the design but feels it is too high.

Mr. Yates commented that the design could be modern, but he also feels it is too high.

Public comment

Ms. Martha Broughton, a member of the public, came forward to speak against the project.

**This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed**

- 7 [COA-024477-2017](#) 2037 West Grace Street - Replace front walk, install planters and retaining wall.



**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Klaus informed the Commission that he spoke to the owner when he went to visit the site. He stated that the owner was understanding of staff's recommendation and were comfortable with fixing the existing concrete.

Mr. Yates commented that the concrete does need to be replaced, but it should be replaced in kind.

**A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be denied for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

**Adjournment**

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 6:33 pm.