

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
May 22, 2018 Meeting**

17. **COA-034578-2018** (S. Barton & R. Lamb) **600 North 28<sup>th</sup> Street**  
**Church Hill North Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:** **Construct a new single family dwelling.**

**Staff Contact:** **C. Jeffries**

**Proposal:** The applicant requests conceptual review and comment on the construction of a single family dwelling on a vacant lot at the corner of North 28<sup>th</sup> Street and East Leigh Street in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The lot was at one time occupied by a 2-story mixed use frame building which was destroyed by a fire in 2007.

The applicant is proposing to construct a 2-story home to address North 28<sup>th</sup> Street. The proposed structure will be set back almost 8 feet from the property line and will be approximately 18 feet in width. The dwelling will be set on a low brick foundation. The home will have a TPO clad shed roof with a parapet and be clad in smooth fiber cement siding. The applicant is proposing a projecting entry bay with a full lite door and transom. The recessed bay will have triple wood casement windows with transoms on the façade which wraps the corner with three identical windows on the side elevation. On the second floor of the façade, the applicant is proposing wood casement windows to align with the windows and door below. The applicant is also proposing a full façade front porch with a simple cornice which wraps the corner to the Leigh Street elevation, and a simple cornice at the roofline which similarly continues around the corner.

On the East Leigh Street elevation, the applicant is proposing a mix of window sizes and an even placement pattern. At the rear, the applicant is proposing a 2<sup>nd</sup> story inset balcony accessed by double full lite doors with a transom above. The applicant is proposing to enclose the balcony with solid board and batten panels. There is a double window with transoms below the door and a single window above a door which accesses the rear yard.

**Surrounding Context:** The residential character of the surrounding blocks is a mix of historic buildings and new construction. The historic structures are 2 to 2 ½ stories in height, primarily frame structures in a mix of architectural styles with varying roof forms and full façade or entry porches. The subject block of North 28<sup>th</sup> Street consists of Italianate and Queen Anne frame double houses and Italianate inspired frame new construction. At the west corner of the North 28<sup>th</sup> and East Leigh Streets is a 2 story brick double house with a side gable roof. At the south corner, the property is developed with a 2 story, Italianate double house; and

the east corner of the intersection is developed with a 2 ½ story home with a front gable roof that addresses East Leigh Street and is clad in stucco.

**Previous Reviews:** The application was conceptually reviewed by the Commission on July 25, 2017, and the Commission had the following comments:

- The structure was out of scale for the neighborhood including massing and height.
- The building should match the setbacks of the other homes on the street.
- The building should not have a commercial storefront if the intention is to use it as a residence.

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the “Standards for New Construction: Residential” on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* utilizing the checklist below.

**S=satisfies**

**D=does not satisfy**

**NA=not applicable**

**S**   **D**   **NA**  
     

**New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns in the surrounding district**

The proposed structure will be setback almost 8 feet which is similar to the structure to the north. The side yard setback of 3 feet is also similar to patterns in the surrounding district.

    

**Where the adjoining buildings have different setbacks, the setback for the new building should be based on the historical pattern for the block**

The proposed setback is consistent with the historic pattern of the block.

    

**New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site**

The structure addresses North 28<sup>th</sup> Street. Historically, development at this corner has addressed North 28<sup>th</sup> Street.

    

**New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district. Form refers to the combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.**

The project is similar in scale to the other residential buildings on the block.

The proposed shed roof form is an element that can be found on homes in the district, though the parapet wall is not commonly found on residential structures. The Commission may wish to consider if the parapet wall could be softened by stepping it down toward the back of the structure and including a trim piece at the top. The proposed projecting bay is also an architectural form found within the district and on the subject block.

**New construction should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps.**

The proposed project incorporates human-scale elements including a full façade front porch, a cornice, and front steps. The Guidelines encourage human scale elements to be included on the secondary, corner elevation for corner properties. The applicant has wrapped the glazing and porch cornice around the corner.

**New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding buildings**

The typical heights of the surrounding buildings are 2 to 2 ½ stories. The applicant has not provided a dimensioned context elevation though the building appears to be similar in height to the surrounding dwellings.

**New construction should respect the typical width, organization of bays, vertical alignment and symmetry of surrounding buildings.**

The project is of similar width to the single family homes on the block and the mixed use structure which stood on the site. The proposed project does maintain the vertical alignment and the symmetry of the surrounding buildings.

**The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings should be compatible with patterns established in the district.**

The typical fenestration pattern in the district includes evenly spaced ranked windows. The Commission's Guidelines for Corner Properties note that windows and doors on the corner elevations should be organized following the principals of the primary elevation to include being aligned vertically. Staff finds the fenestration pattern to be compatible with pattern found in the district.

**Porch and cornice heights should be compatible with adjacent buildings**

The applicant has not provided a dimensioned context elevation for staff to review. The Commission's Guidelines for Corner Properties note that particular attention should be paid to the height of foundations to create an appropriately scaled appearance that relates to neighboring structures and is consistent with neighboring properties and that heights should be kept to a level that will enhance, not detract, from the pedestrian experience. It appears the heights are appropriate but dimensions are needed to confirm.

- Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted.**

The applicant is proposing fiber cement lap siding, wood casement windows, and a brick foundation. The Commission may wish to consider if solid board and batten is an appropriate railing material for the rear balcony. The window on the façade in the project bay should be a double hung 1/1 window to reflect the window composition of the neighboring homes. Details of the door material, the porch wrapping, as well as the paneling surrounding the second story windows on the primary elevations will need to be provided.

The following items will need to be included for final review (please refer to the Commission's New Construction Checklist and Required Dimensions document for additional details):

1. List of windows and doors to include size, material, and design
2. Description of all materials (attach specification sheets if necessary)
3. Dimensioned context elevation
4. Dimensioned floor plans
5. Statement of how the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* informed the proposed work.