

7. COA-071512-2020

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

April 28, 2020

PROPERTY ADDRESS

1302 E. Cary Street

DISTRICT

Shockoe Slip

APPLICANT

AJA Jr. Trust u/a 73

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jones

Commission of
Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Rehabilitate a 3-story brick commercial building, including creating an accessible entrance.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The exiting building is a ca. 1869-1870 three-story brick commercial building designed in the Italianate style.
- The applicant proposes to rehabilitate the existing building by:
 - Painting the entire building
 - Replacing two windows to create an ADA-accessible entrance
 - Replacing non-historic windows
 - Installing new awnings and signage
 - Repairing windows as needed



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

The Commission has not previously approved this application.

STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- the new window fit within the original opening, be a clear glass, and the specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval
- the new door be a simple, modern design with clear glass panels
- any replacement materials match the existing in terms of materials, design, and profile
- the awning mounting hardware be installed directly into the mortar joints to avoid damage to the existing masonry
- the applicant submit a color found on the palette for masonry/red brick to staff for review and approval

STAFF ANALYSIS

Building and Site Accessibility #5, pg. 79	<i>When it is not possible to modify an existing entrance, a new entrance may be made, or an existing opening may be altered to create a new entrance.</i>	The applicant proposes to convert two windows to ADA-compliant doors by lowering the sills. Staff recommends approval of the ADA-complaint door opening.
Doors and Windows, #5, pg. 49	<i>5. Original door and window surroundings should be retained. When selecting new doors and door surrounds, keep in mind that leaded, beveled, or etched glass is rare in Richmond's Old and Historic Districts, and is strongly discouraged and rarely permitted. Similarly, stamped or molded faux paneled doors are inappropriate substitutes for door types found in Richmond's Old and Historic Districts.</i>	The applicant proposes to recreate the appearance of an existing door for the new ADA-complaint door. Staff recommends approval of a door in this location with the condition that <u>the new door be a simple, modern design with clear glass panels.</u>
Window Replacement and/or Reconstruction, pg. 69	<i>10. The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings.</i>	On the S. 13 th Street elevation the applicant proposes to replace a non-historic, tinted glass window. Staff recommends approval of the replacement window with the condition that <u>the new window fit within the original opening, be a clear glass, and the specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval</u>
Window Repair, pg. 69	<i>6. Original windows should be repaired by patching, splicing, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing them.</i>	Staff recommends approval of repairing the existing windows with the condition that <u>any replacement materials match the existing in terms of materials, design, and profiles.</u>
Awning Design & Placement, pg. 72	<p><i>1. Awnings should be placed carefully so that building elements or existing materials are not damaged or obscured.</i></p> <p><i>2. The size and placement of awnings should not interfere with existing signs, distinctive architectural features of the building or with street trees or other elements along the street.</i></p> <p><i>4. The use of metal, plastic or overly ornate fabric awnings should be avoided.</i></p> <p><i>5. Awning mounting hardware should be installed directly into mortar joints to avoid damage to historic masonry</i></p>	The applicant proposes to remove 11 non-historic awnings and install two new awnings, one each on South 13 th Street and East Cary Street. The awnings will be 2'-6" tall and 2'-6" deep and will span the distance between the pilasters. Staff recommends approval of the new awnings with the condition that <u>the mounting hardware be installed directly into the mortar joints to avoid damage to the existing masonry.</u>
Signs on Awnings. Pg. 72	<i>8. The front panel or valance of an awning may be used for signage as long as the resulting square footage, when added together with all other signage for a particular building, does not exceed the maximum allowed by the zoning code. It is the responsibility of the applicant to obtain the approval of the zoning department, if necessary. In most cases, signage on awnings is allowed only in non-residential areas. Letters may be sewn, screened or painted onto the awning fabric.</i>	The applicant proposes to add a company name and logo to the awnings. Staff recommends approval as awnings are a traditional place for signage. Staff recommends the applicant consult the Zoning Department to determine if the signage meets existing zoning codes.

Paint, Historic
Masonry, #s1,3,
pg. 63

1) Do not paint historic brick or stone masonry that has not previously been painted. Painting previously unpainted masonry is historically inaccurate and is not permitted.
3) Colors associated with the colors of natural brick are strongly encouraged and are preferable to less appropriate colors (white, green, blue, etc.).

The applicant proposes to paint the exterior of the building with the following colors: Gray (SW 7045) for the body, Anonymous (SW7046) for the window and door frames and sills, and Urbane Bronze (SW7048) for the doors and windows sashes.

The applicant proposes to paint the previously painted masonry a neutral grey color. Staff finds this color is not in keeping with the paint palette which stresses the use of traditional brick colors for masonry buildings, and recommends the applicant submit a color found on the palette for masonry/red brick to staff for review and approval. Staff finds the Anonymous and Urbane Bronze are in keeping with the neutral color palette.

Paint, Masonry
Buildings, All
Styles, pg. 65

Body Color – Brick: reds, browns, yellow-clay, previously painted brick only, match original brick color when possible.
Sills – Neutrals, match original stone color
Doors – blacks, browns, greens, reds, yellows, and neutrals

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES



Figure 1. 1302-1306 East Broad ca. 1970.



Figure 2. 1302-1306 East Broad St



Figure 3. South 13th Street window to be replaced



Figure 4. South 13th Street window to become a door.



Figure 5. East Cary Street window to become a door.



Figure 6. Evidence of original brick color.