

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
May 23, 2017 Meeting**

6. **COA-016768** (H. Wilson) **520 W. Marshall Street
Jackson Ward Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Replace five windows on front façade.**

Staff Contact: **C. Jeffries**

The applicant requests approval to replace the front windows at this property in the Jackson Ward Old and Historic District. The applicant proposes to install new one-over-one wood windows with a white finish.

This application is the result of enforcement activity as the windows were replaced without prior review and approval. In addition, the applicant received approval to modify the windows on the side and rear of the structure in August of 2010. The front windows were not included in this prior application. The conditions of the 2010 approval were not met as the applicant replaced all windows on the side and rear of the structure with one-over-one aluminum clad wood windows. Photographs of the windows from 2017 and 2010 are included at the end of this report.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The general Standards for Rehabilitation listed on page 57 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that original windows should be retained. Page 67 is even more specific about window replacement, and provides the following recommendations:

6. Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.
7. The number, location, size, or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows, or by installing replacement sash that does not fit the original window.
8. The architectural character of windows should not be altered by inappropriate materials or finishes that radically change the sash, depth of reveal, muntin configuration, the reflective quality or color of the glazing, or the appearance of the frame.

The pictures from the 2010 application show that the windows on the façade were 1/1 windows and the three upper story windows (Windows 1-3) included ogee lugs. Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the five front windows (Windows 1-5), provided that ogee lugs to match the previous windows be added to Windows 1-3.

The historic wood windows on the rear and side elevations which were present in 2010 were a mix of 1/1 windows with ogee lugs and 6/6 windows in various stages of deterioration. Below staff has outlined the 2010 conditions of approval which are not met by the existing replacement windows and staff's recommendations for changes to the windows that are necessary to meet the *Guidelines*:

Windows 6 and 7:

2010 Condition of Approval: The window casings at Windows 6 and 7 shall be retained and repaired. The window sash of Window 6 shall be retained and repaired and Window 7 should have a replacement wood sash to match Window 6 (salvage sash is acceptable).

Existing Conditions: The windows were replaced with one-over-one aluminum clad wood windows.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that ogee lugs be added to Windows 6 and 7 to match the sash of Window 6 which was removed.

Windows 8-10:

2010 Condition of Approval: The windows shall be replaced with the proposed product, provided that the windows are six-over-six sash with true or simulated divided lites.

Existing Conditions: These windows were replaced with one-over-one aluminum clad wood windows.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the sashes of Windows 8-10 be replaced with aluminum clad wood six-over-six true or simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar between the glass.

Windows 11 and 12:

2010 Condition of Approval: The window casings shall be retained and repaired. The sash and sills may be replaced with the specified product provided that the windows are six-over-six sash with true or simulated divided lites.

Existing Conditions: The windows were replaced with one-over-one aluminum clad wood windows.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the sashes of Windows 11 and 12 be replaced with aluminum clad wood six-over-six true or simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar between the glass.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with Richmond City Code Section 30-930.7 (b) *Standards for rehabilitation* and pages 57 and 67 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, adopted by the Commission in accordance with Section 30-930.7 (g) of the City Code.

520 West Marshall Street, May 10, 2017



520 West Marshall Street, 2010



1, 2, 3



5



6



7



9 & 10



8



11



12

