



# City of Richmond

City Hall  
900 East Broad Street

## Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review

---

Tuesday, November 23, 2021

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

---

**This meeting will be held through electronic participation means.**

[PDRPRES  
2021.177](#) Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review.

**Attachments:** [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURA..](#)

### Call to Order

The meeting began at 3:31pm.

Eva Campbell read the announcement for virtual public meetings:

This meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review will be held as an electronic meeting pursuant to and in compliance with Ordinance 2020-093. The public has been notified of this meeting and how to participate by a notice in the Richmond Times Dispatch, and an instruction sheet posted with the agenda on the Legistar website. The public may participate in the meeting by calling \*67-804-316-9457 and entering 201-932-327#. Public comment will be heard for each item on the agenda after the applicant has responded to staff recommendations. Members of the public will be limited to 3 minutes for their comments.

Commission members are electronically present, none are physically present in City Hall.

We will be conducting a roll call vote with the Secretary stating each Commissioners name prior to voting.

### Roll Call

**Present --** 7 - \* Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., \* Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, \* Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, \* Commissioner Andrew Moore, \* Commissioner Sean Wheeler, \* Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and \* Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - \* Commissioner Mitch Danese

### Approval of Minutes

August 2021

**A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the August minutes.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

September 2021

**A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the September minutes.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

**Secretary’s Report**

Ms. Campbell said that meetings may start being in person starting in January; the citizen-at-large position will go to Council next month.

**Administrative Approval Report**

Emily Routman explained that the new permitting system cannot report the building/trade permits, and Staff will have to revisit that process. Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked about the Administrative Approval for a fence at 1805 Monument Ave. Mr. Dandridge said that the fence is supposed to be on the front and will be a low, black, aluminum fence.

**Enforcement Report**

Ms. Campbell said that Staff has been starting to look at enforcement and violations. Commission Chair Johnson adjourned the Business portion at 3:41pm.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the regular agenda to the consent agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore seconded by Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez, to move 2306 E. Grace St. to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Jean Wight said she was here. She said that they contacted their neighbors and Church Hill Association when they put their application in and there has been unanimous approval from those she contacted.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 7– Johnson, Pearson, Wheeler, Rodriguez, Morgan, Moore, Brewer  
Excused – 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler seconded by Commissioner Moore, to move 509 N. 28th Street to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. William Gillette said he was here representing the applicant. He asked if the application would stay on the Regular Agenda so he can discuss one point.

The motion was withdrawn.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the Consent Agenda as revised.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any Commission discussion on the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 7– Johnson, Pearson, Wheeler, Rodriguez, Morgan, Moore, Brewer  
Excused – 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, that this be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

3. [COA-101633-2021](#) 2306 E. Grace St. - Enclose a second story rear porch.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application as submitted.**

**The motion passed by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

1. [COA-101636-2021](#) 2609 W. Grace St. - Replace a tiled front porch with a concrete floor.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[2609 W Grace Public Comment](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners. There were none.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Tim Dickson, responded yes. He said that there are other concrete floors around the property; he also tried to find tile and couldn't find any similar designs. He also said that the porch floor isn't visible from the street. The porch floor had bad maintenance problems.

Commissioner Pearson asked how long they've owned the property. Mr. Dickson said maybe around 1965.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if he had any original photos of the porch floor. Mr. Dickson did not.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked about the extent of the search for tiles. She said she found tiles that looked similar that can be for outdoor use. Mr. Dickson said he assumed that no one else could find it – 12 x 12. He said he'd be open to doing the tile if it's available.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to partially approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: denial of the use of concrete for the new porch floor; and the front porch floor be replaced in-kind, or with a material that conveys the same appearance of the historic front porch floor; material submitted to staff, Chair, and Vice-Chair for review and approval.

Commissioner Moore said that unglazed penny round tile are widely available and aren't a hard thing to find. He asked if the design is supposed to be replicated; Mr. Dandridge said a simplified design or just using tile in general would be acceptable. Commissioner Moore said it's tricky to delegate this to staff for approval.

Commission Chair Johnson said that approval should include Chair and Co-Chair approval as a friendly amendment. Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez said she approved of that amendment.

Commissioner Wheeler said that there are specialty tile stores that source this, as opposed to a big box retailer.

Mr. Dickson said structurally, he'd like to get this done as soon as possible. Commission Chair Johnson said that the whole permit has to be approved by staff first, so he should have the tile pattern ready for the permit process.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to partially approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: denial of the use of concrete for the new porch floor; and the front porch floor be replaced in-kind, or with a material that conveys the same appearance of the historic front porch floor; material submitted to staff, Chair, and Vice-Chair for review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

2. [COA-100319-2021](#) 404 N. 23rd St. - Construct a new single-family, detached residence on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans \(10/26/2021\)](#)  
[Staff Report \(10/26/2021\)](#)  
[404 N 23rd Public Comment \(10/26/2021\)](#)  
[Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[404 N 23rd Public Comment \(11/23/2021\)](#)

The application was presented by Alyson Oliver.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Josh Bosler, responded yes. He talked about the changes they made since the last Commission meeting. Mr. Bosler and Mr. Greg Shron said they would be okay with the staff recommendations. He also said that they tried to reach out to neighbors but they seemed uninterested.

Commissioner Moore said that the rooftop projection is so visible from the street, so maybe the projection could be put on the other side of the house. Mr. Bosler said that side of the building would be more visible, actually, because the line of sight is more visible.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if there's a zoning variance needed for the lot size. Mr.

Bosler said no, this project is by-right.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Martha Broughton is on the Church Hill Association but is speaking as an individual. She is curious if the awkward-looking chimney would set a precedent for other buildings that want a roof terrace. She thinks the design of the building is appropriate, but isn't sure about the materials. Commission Chair Johnson said these projects are on a case-by-case basis only.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the upper porch stair tower be clad in a white hardie siding finish to match the siding used on all other sides of the dwelling; and a final window schedule be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

Commissioner Moore said the design has been moving in a positive direction, and that the rooftop access is the item that's bothering him. He said it doesn't necessarily damage the integrity of the historic fabric of the District. He asked what role do the public comment letters play in the deliberations.

Commission Chair Johnson said they take the public comments seriously.

Commissioner Morgan said that she has a hard time recommending approval of a project that have many negative public comments.

Commissioner Brewer said that she appreciates the applicants' response to the comments and how they've listened.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the upper porch stair tower be clad in a white hardie siding finish to match the siding used on all other sides of the dwelling; and a final window schedule be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

4. [COA-094562-2021](#) 1600 Monument Ave. - Construct a new enclosed outdoor seating area

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans \(July 2021\)](#)

[Staff Report \(July 2021\)](#)

[Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Moore said that the renderings show round columns – he asked if this was discussed with the applicant. Mr. Dandridge said that the official drawings were for square columns.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Michael Pellis, responded yes. He says he has no objections to the staff recommendations. He said that the roof currently drains into the back garden area and the structure is not up against the building.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez said she was pleasantly surprised by the updated design. She asked if the black metal railing is currently there or if the rendering should be updated. Mr. Pellis said it's an ABC regulation to have a railing by the patio.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: that any new gate or fencing be a simple design that is in compliance with any applicable zoning regulations for fences, and that it be submitted to staff for review and approval; that round columns be utilized rather than the proposed square columns; that the applicant utilize an approvable material such as wood or composite wood for the column wraps and cornice molding; columns and entablature be aligned to be architecturally accurate; that additional information on how the roof will be designed to accommodate stormwater drainage be submitted for administrative review; and that the color and design of the outdoor curtains/drapes be submitted to staff for review.

Commissioner Moore said that there should be proper alignment with the shaft of the columns.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez said she agrees with a friendly amendment.

Mr. Pellis said the intention is to have it correctly placed, and the renderings need to be updated.

Commissioner Moore said that there's a strong precedent for front porches on Monument, so he could be persuaded for a pergola if it was on the rear or side.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: that any new gate or fencing be a simple design that is in compliance with any applicable zoning regulations for fences, and that it be submitted to staff for review and approval; that round columns be utilized rather than the proposed square columns; that the applicant utilize an approvable material such as wood or composite wood for the column wraps and cornice molding; columns and entablature be aligned to be architecturally accurate; that additional information on how the roof will be designed to accommodate stormwater drainage be submitted for administrative**

review; and that the color and design of the outdoor curtains/drapes be submitted to staff for review.

The motion passed by the following vote:

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 2 - Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

5. [COA-101995-2021](#) 509 N. 28th Street - Construct a new two-story single family detached residence on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Will Gillette, responded yes. He wanted to clarify about the change they didn't make: about adding the coping and batons. They wanted to stay away from a sense of false historicism, but they wanted to make sure it was representative of the neighborhood.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final color and material specifications be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and final window and door specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final color and material specifications be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and final window and door specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.**

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Excused --** 2 - Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

## **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

6. [COA-101634-2021](#) 618-620 Chamberlayne Pkwy. - Construct two attached, two-story, single-family, double houses on a vacant lot.



**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Eva Campbell.

The applicant, Forrest Fraizer, identified himself. He said that they wanted to do a more modern interpretation that used materials and massing to represent the neighborhood instead of historic copies. He said it's zoned R-63 so it's contextual within the neighborhood.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commissioner Moore said that he has no conceptual issues with a modern interpretation of a historic form, but there are essential characteristics that need to be worked on: it's critical to have a front porch even if it's a busy street. He thinks it's too stripped down. He thinks there's a way to get to a modern interpretation. Mr. Frazier said more detail would be helpful and he will provide that in the next submission.

Commissioner Wheeler said that he would reiterate many of Commissioner Moore's comments. He appreciates the modern interpretation, but that it needs to be reigned back into the structures of the district. It needs a front porch and a roof line. Addressing the street with the door is important. He wants taller windows on the first floor but he finds the brick interesting. He thinks it's correct to set back the third floor. He would look to have another banding, potentially at the cornice, and have some kind of relief at the windows too.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez said that the entryway to Jackson Ward is problematic in general and this building would benefit from having a level of inviting-ness. She doesn't understand where the doors are and thinks it's confusing. She wonders if recessing the center 2 units could give it a courtyard feel and increase the inviting-ness.

Commission Chair Johnson said that it's a very open lot and he doesn't have a problem with 3 stories. There should always be an entry point on the front street. He would point them in the direction of the design of rowhouses (E. Grace at 27th?). He thinks depth or banding is a good idea.

Commissioner Pearson said he will echo his colleagues, but he thinks that uniform setbacks would be best instead of a recessed courtyard.

Commissioner Brewer had no comments.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

**This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed**

7. [COA-101635-2021](#) 967 Pink St. - Construct a new single-family, two-story, detached house on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Pink 967 - Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

[967 Pink Public Comment](#)

The application was presented by Eva Campbell.

Commissioner Pearson recused himself and left the meeting.

The applicant, Amanda Seibert, identified herself. She said that in her past projects, it seemed like the Commissioners were leaning towards modern elements. She also said that there will be houses on either side eventually, so it will not be visible.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commissioner Wheeler said he appreciates the modern approach but would disagree on the vertical siding comment made by staff. The roof is concerning because of the sheer size of the project.

Commissioner Moore said that this is a nicely proportioned house. One preference would be to think about changing the relief on the side elevations so that the gable portion is proud of the adjacent so it's expressed a little more strongly. He thinks the vertical siding is more of a country vernacular, so he would agree with staff on that. He thinks maybe breaking it up with some vertical trim could work and make it a little more interesting. Commission Chair Johnson said he would agree with breaking up the sides a little so it's not as much of an elongated structure.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

**This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed**

## **Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 5:48pm.