

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
June 26, 2018 Meeting**

4. **COA-034578-2018** (S. Barten & R. Lamb) **600 North 28th Street**
Church Hill North Old and Historic District

Project Description: **Construct a new single family dwelling.**

Staff Contact: **C. Jeffries**

Proposal: The applicant requests approval for the construction of a single family dwelling on a vacant lot at the corner of North 28th Street and East Leigh Street in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The lot was at one time occupied by a 2-story mixed use frame building which was destroyed by a fire in 2007.

The applicant is proposing to construct a 2-story home to address North 28th Street. The proposed structure will be set back almost 8 feet from the property line and will be approximately 18 feet in width. The dwelling will be set on a low brick foundation. The home will have a TPO clad shed roof with a parapet and be clad in smooth fiber cement siding. The applicant is proposing a projecting entry bay with a full lite door and transom. The recessed bay will have triple wood casement windows with transoms on the façade which wraps the corner with three identical windows on the side elevation. On the second floor of the façade, the applicant is proposing wood casement windows to align with the windows and door below. The applicant is also proposing a full façade front porch with a simple cornice which wraps the corner to the Leigh Street elevation, and a simple cornice at the roofline which similarly continues around the corner.

On the East Leigh Street elevation, the applicant is proposing a mix of window sizes and an even placement pattern. At the rear, the applicant is proposing a 2nd story inset balcony accessed by double full lite doors with a transom above. The applicant is proposing to enclose the balcony with solid board and batten panels. There is a double window with transoms below the door and a single window above a door which accesses the rear yard.

Surrounding Context: The residential character of the surrounding blocks is a mix of historic buildings and new construction. The historic structures are 2 to 2 ½ stories in height, primarily frame structures in a mix of architectural styles with varying roof forms and full façade or entry porches. The subject block of North 28th Street consists of Italianate and Queen Anne frame double houses and Italianate inspired frame new construction. At the west corner of the North 28th and East Leigh Streets is a 2 story brick double house with a side gable roof. At the south corner, the property is developed with a 2 story, Italianate double house; and the east corner of the intersection is developed with a 2 ½ story home with a front gable roof that addresses East Leigh Street and is clad in stucco.

Previous Reviews: The proposed design was conceptually reviewed by the Commission on May 22, 2018, and the Commission had the following comments:

- The Commission commended the applicant for responding to the Commission’s and community’s concerns.
- Commissioners stated a preference for a straight parapet and gave suggestions for cornice details.

In response to the Commission’s comments, the applicant altered the plans as follows:

- A trim board has been added to the parapet walls and additional detailing was added to the cornice line.
- A sill has been added to the single casement window on the façade.
- Detailing has been added to the board and batten panels on the rear balcony.
- In addition, the fenestration pattern was adjusted to include increasing the height of a window on the west elevation and adding a basement egress window on the north elevation. The fenestration pattern on the east elevation was also altered, including adding four square windows on the second story.

The applicant is seeking **Final Review** for this project. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the “Standards for New Construction: Residential” on pages 46-51 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* utilizing the checklist below.

S=satisfies

D=does not satisfy

NA=not applicable

S **D** **NA**

New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns in the surrounding district

The proposed structure will be setback almost 8 feet which is similar to the structure to the north. The side yard setback of 3 feet is also similar to patterns in the surrounding district.

Where the adjoining buildings have different setbacks, the setback for the new building should be based on the historical pattern for the block

The proposed setback is consistent with the historic pattern of the block.

New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site

The structure addresses North 28th Street. Historically, development at this corner has addressed North 28th Street.

- New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district. Form refers to the combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.**

The project is similar in scale to the other residential buildings on the block.

- New construction should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps.**

The proposed project incorporates human-scale elements including a full façade front porch, a cornice, and front steps. The *Guidelines* encourage human scale elements to be included on the secondary, corner elevation for corner properties. The applicant has wrapped the glazing and porch cornice around the corner.

- New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding buildings**

The typical heights of the surrounding buildings are 2 to 2 ½ stories. The applicant has not provided a dimensioned context elevation though the building appears to be similar in height to the surrounding dwellings.

- New construction should respect the typical width, organization of bays, vertical alignment and symmetry of surrounding buildings.**

The project is of similar width to the single family homes on the block and the mixed use structure which stood on the site. The proposed project does maintain the vertical alignment and the symmetry of the surrounding buildings.

- The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings should be compatible with patterns established in the district.**

The typical fenestration pattern in the district includes evenly spaced ranked windows. The Commission's Guidelines for Corner Properties note that windows and doors on the corner elevations should be organized following the principals of the primary elevation to include being aligned vertically. Staff finds the fenestration pattern to be generally compatible with patterns found in the district, however the square windows on the north elevation is not a form found in the district. Staff recommends that these windows be modified to include window shapes and sizes consistent with the district. The revised design should be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

As floorplans were not provided, staff recommends dimension strings to locate the horizontal placement of windows be submitted for administrative review.

- Porch and cornice heights should be compatible with adjacent buildings**

The applicant has not provided a dimensioned context elevation for staff to review. The Commission's Guidelines for Corner Properties note that particular attention should be paid to the height of foundations to create an appropriately scaled appearance that relates to neighboring structures and is consistent with neighboring properties and that heights should be kept to a level that will enhance, not detract, from the pedestrian experience. Staff recommends the height of the foundation at each corner of the structure along 28th Street be provided for administrative review.

Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted.

The applicant is proposing fiber cement lap siding, wood casement windows, and a brick foundation. The railing on the proposed rear stairs should be Richmond rail, painted or stained a neutral color to complement the main structure.

Additionally, staff recommends the approval be conditioned on the following:

- The locations of the mechanical equipment and electric meter be submitted for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.