

**13. COA-053588-2019**

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

May 28, 2019

PROPERTY ADDRESS

106 East Clay Street

DISTRICT

Jackson Ward

APPLICANT

721 West Clay LLC

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jeffries

Commission of  
Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



PROJECT DESCRIPTION

**Rehabilitate an attached single family home, to include rebuilding the rear porch and porch enclosures.**

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate a brick Italianate attached single family home in the Jackson Ward City Old and Historic District.
- The building has been vacant for several years and is in disrepair. The applicant recently stabilized the rear porch which had collapsed and was cited for a property maintenance violation.
- The planned rehabilitation work includes:
  - Rebuild a two-story rear porch.
  - Rebuild a two-story rear porch enclosure.
  - In-fill two rear doors with brick.
  - General repair work including painting.
  - Other work not visible from the public right of way.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

**APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS**

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

The Commission approved an application made by a previous owner to rehabilitate the building and enclose a side porch in 2015.

STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- A full window survey be conducted if any windows require replacement. Details on a proposed replacement product that meets the Commission’s Guidelines be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.
- The rear windows visible from the public right of way be 6/6 windows with true or simulated divided lights.
- The rear door openings be enclosed from the interior in a manner that could be reversed in the future and maintains the exterior appearance of the entrances.
- A site plan with the location of the HVAC units be submitted for administrative review and approval.
- The roof of the new enclosure align with the porch enclosure on the attached structure and the design be modified to reference the historic porch by adding a horizontal element between the stories.
- The new rear porch be constructed of wood, be painted or stained a neutral color to be administratively approved by staff, and utilize a Richmond Rail.
- Staff recommends denial of the installation of exterior vinyl windows.

---

## STAFF ANALYSIS

---

Standards for Rehabilitation, pg. 59

1. *Retain original features and materials that define the building style, including but not limited to wood siding, shingles, stucco and masonry.*
2. *Retain original wood features such as cornices, brackets, window and doorway surrounds, sashes and doors.*
4. *Retain original roof shape, size, materials and related elements.*
5. *Retain original windows including both functional and decorative elements.*
6. *Retain original entrances and porches.*
7. *Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements*

The proposed repair work is generally consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation. The applicant is proposing to retain or replace in-kind deteriorated elements.

---

Windows #7, 11, pg. 69

7. *Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.*
11. *Because the material cannot be manufactured to model effectively the appearance of historic windows, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts.*

The elevations note that existing windows will be “refurbished where possible.” Staff has observed that a number of the windows on the side and rear of the building are missing, and the windows on the façade are present. Staff recommends the applicant submit a full window survey if any windows require replacement. Details on a proposed replacement product that meets the Commission’s Guidelines should also be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The window schedule indicates that vinyl windows are proposed. Staff recommends denial of exterior vinyl windows.

Recent photographs of the rear of the building indicate that the surviving windows in the rear have a 6/6 light configuration. Previously approved plans for this property also indicate that the rear windows were 6/6. Staff recommends the rear windows visible from the public right of way be 6/6 windows with true or simulated divided lights.

---

Windows #5, pg. 69

*Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged.*

The applicant is proposing to infill two doors on the first and second story in the rear of the building to accommodate a new floor plan. The rear doors are visible from the alley as well as North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street due to adjacent parking areas. As the Guidelines strongly discourage the infilling of original masonry openings, staff recommends the openings be enclosed from the interior in a manner that could be reversed

		<u>in the future and maintains the exterior appearance of the entrances.</u>
Mechanical Equipment #1, pg. 68	<i>New units should be placed in side or rear yards so as to minimize their visual impact.</i>	The application does not indicate where the HVAC units will be located. <u>Staff recommends a site plan with the location of the HVAC units be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u>
Porches, Entrances & Doors #13, pg. 71	<i>Porch enclosures to aid in energy conservation are only appropriate on secondary elevations. Solid materials are not recommended for use in enclosure projects since they can radically alter the historic appearance of a porch. Glass enclosures which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred.</i>	The applicant is proposing to replace a small enclosed porch that no longer exists. Photographs of the building from 2012 show the second floor was previously enclosed with solid bead board. Though the proposed enclosure does not meet the Commission's Guidelines for porch enclosures, the porch was previously enclosed on at least one floor with a solid wall. <u>Staff recommends the roof of the new enclosure align with the porch enclosure on the attached structure and the design be modified to reference the historic porch by adding a horizontal element between the stories.</u>
Porches, Entrances & Doors #5, pg. 71	<i>The entire porch should only be replaced if it is too deteriorated to repair or is completely missing; replacements should match the original as much as possible.</i>	The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the two-story rear porch which had collapsed. <u>Staff recommends the new porch be constructed of wood, be painted or stained a neutral color to be administratively approved by staff, and utilize a Richmond Rail.</u>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES



Figure 1. Facade of 106 East Clay Street.



Figure 2. Rear porch, 2019.



Figure 3. Rear porch, 2012.



Figure 4. Rear windows, 2019