

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
February 24, 2015 Meeting**

10. **CAR No. 15-012** (Instant Construction) **402-404 N. 29<sup>th</sup> Street**  
**Church Hill North Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:** **Extensive exterior alterations**

**Staff Contact:** **W. Palmquist**

The applicant requests approval for rehabilitation work performed on the exterior of this structure in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The application is the result of enforcement activity. All work has been performed and the applicant is seeking approval for the completed work.

The work completed consists of the replacement of lapboard siding, new front doors, installation of new roof frieze, replacement of porch lights, painting of the structure, and alterations to the front porch, including the roof and columns. Following is a detail of each work item.

Replacement of lapboard siding

The applicant removed all the vinyl siding on the structure in order to uncover the original wood siding. They replaced rotten wood siding where needed while keeping the existing lapboard siding that was salvageable. The original lapboard siding has several lines of beading running in the center of the board as well as a bevel at the top edge. While the replacement siding closely matches the width and reveal of the original siding, it does not have the beading or bevel reminiscent of the original siding.

Front doors

The front doors which were removed were six-paneled doors, one with a security door in front, and do not appear to be historic or original to the structure. The new doors are wooden with three vertical panels and six lites, painted red.

Installation/restoration of roof frieze

Before the work took place, the original frieze was covered by vinyl siding. The applicant states that the frieze was uncovered and subsequently restored with replacement wood where needed. However, photographs of the structure while work was on-going show the ghosting of the original frieze which does not match that of the installed cornice.

Replacement of porch lights

The front porch lights were replaced with a larger style porch light.

### Alterations to the front porch

Various alterations were completed on the front porch. The flat seam metal porch roof was replaced with a black, standing seam metal roof. Simple, square porch dentils were installed at the cornice of the porch roof. The existing square porch columns were replaced with turned columns. The center porch column and railing were removed.

### Painting of structure

The building was originally a light yellow or cream color. The body of the structure was painted gray. The cornice was painted a beige color. All trim was repainted white. The front doors were painted red.

### Miscellaneous items

A contemporary, low brick wall on either side of the front porch steps was removed, while the first two to three layers of brick were retained to delineate planting areas. The front porch foundation appears to have been parged. A wooden picket fence and gate was installed between the structure and adjacent building to the south.

**Staff does not recommend approval of the project.** While much of the work completed was consistent with in-kind repair and replacement, many of the work items detailed above are not supported by the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically referring to the siding, roof frieze, and front porch.

The *Guidelines* state to, "Retain original features and materials that define the building style, including but not limited to wood siding, shingles, stucco and masonry," as well as to, "Retain original entrances and porches including doors, frames, fanlights, sidelights, steps, balustrades, pilasters, entablatures, columns and decorative features" (p. 55 #1 & #6).

Staff recommends that the applicant return to the Commission with an updated application which details the restoration of the original roof frieze as evidenced by the ghosting of the original feature, as well as restores the features of the porch, including the center railing between the two sides, to their original condition. In regards to the siding, an amenable outcome could be the salvaging of all original beaded siding to the front façade of the structure, reserving the side and rear elevations for the new, replacement siding.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is not consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code and with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

402-404 N. 29th Street - Photo Documentation of Work Performed



Prior to work performed - Google Streetview July 2014



Prior to work performed - Google Streetview July 2014

# 402-404 N. 29th Street - Photo Documentation of Work Performed



Photo taken 10/7/2014



Photo taken 10/7/2014

402-404 N. 29th Street - Photo Documentation of Work Performed



Photo taken 10/31/2014

402-404 N. 29th Street - Photo Documentation of Work Performed



Photo taken 11/10/2014



Photo taken 11/10/2014

# 402-404 N. 29th Street - Photo Documentation of Work Performed



Photo taken 1/5/2015



Photo taken 1/5/2015