



Commission of Architectural Review

1. COA-169066-2025	Final Review	Meeting Date: 7/22/2025
Applicant/Petitioner	Will Gillette	
Project Description	Rehabilitate an existing rear porch and second-story sunroom	
Project Location		
Address: 1212 West Franklin Street		
Historic District: Monument Avenue		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes to rehabilitate a two-story masonry building, including rebuilding the existing rear sunroom and covered deck.</p> <p>A door on the east elevation will also be converted into a window.</p> <p>The rebuilt second story sunroom will resemble the original's fenestration but will have shorter windows on the side elevations.</p> <p>Decorative mullions that match the original and are based on photographic documentation will be applied to the new windows.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, Alex.Dandridge@RVA.gov, (804)646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Final cladding material of the sunroom be either wood or a fiber cement material; final specification be submitted for administrative approval. New windows on sunroom be wood or aluminum clad wood with simulated divided lights. Window trim, sills, and fluted mullions match the original as closely as possible in design and dimension. All exterior materials and building elements on the primary building and rear garage be repaired/retained including wooden architectural elements, roofing material, windows, doors, railings, etc. Any alterations or replacement of any exterior elements on the primary portion of the building or the rear garage must be submitted in a subsequent COA 	

	<p>application for commission or staff review prior to completing work.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing rear chimney adjacent to the frame addition be preserved.
--	--

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Building Elements, Porches, Entrances & Doors, Entrance and Porch Removal, Replacement and Reconstruction, pg. 71	<p>4. Do not remove or radically change entrances and porches important in defining the building's overall historic character. Front and side porches are architecturally more ornate than utilitarian back porches.</p> <p>5. The entire porch should only be replaced if it is too deteriorated to repair or is completely missing; replacements should match the original as much as possible.</p> <p>8. Do not strip entrances and porches of historic material and details that should be retained in any repair or partial replacement.</p>	<p>1212 West Franklin Street is a two-story masonry building that historically featured a frame rear addition that includes a covered porch on the first story with a sunroom enclosure above. The first story covered porch is minimally visible from the public right-of-way.</p> <p>The application proposes to rehabilitate this rear, frame portion of the building. The photos in the application show that the original walls, windows, and other components of the sunroom are in place; however, after a staff site visit, all elements have been removed, except for structural members. There was evidence of significant deterioration.</p> <p>The first story porch will be reconstructed to include simple square posts and a simple railing. Porch decking will run perpendicular to the face of the building. The design is in-keeping with the more utilitarian appearance of the original porch.</p> <p>The sunroom and porch will not be completely removed but rehabilitated.</p> <p>While staff was not able to find images of the original cladding material of the sunroom enclosure, based on the other materials found on the building, specifically within the gable face on the façade, the original cladding material may have been a textured stucco. The application is proposing to reclad the sunroom enclosure with trim and paneling. The final materials are unclear. Staff would support the use of trim and paneling in this location, as it is a secondary elevation and the trim design plays a key role in referencing the original dimensions of the historic windows, specifically on the side elevations.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the final cladding material of the sunroom be either wood or a fiber cements material, and that final specification be submitted for administrative approval.</u></p>
Building Elements, Windows, Window Replacement and/or Reconstruction, pg. 69	<p>7. <i>Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.</i></p> <p>8. <i>The number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new</i></p>	<p>For the sunroom, windows are proposed to match the original nine-over-one pane configuration. The fluted mullions will be reconstructed and incorporated into the design to match the original.</p> <p>The grouping of three nine-over-one windows with fluted mullions will be reconstructed on the rear elevation of the sunroom to match the original. Both</p>

	<p><i>openings, blocking out windows or by installing replacement sash that do not fit the original window. Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis.</i></p> <p><i>10. The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings</i></p>	<p>the east and west elevations of the sunroom will include a paring of two windows with fluted mullions.</p> <p>While the original design of these elevations included nine-over-one windows like the rear elevation, the new design will feature smaller windows with nine panes which reference the design of the original upper sashes of the original windows. Trim and paneling below the sills of the smaller windows will refence the original dimension of the windows.</p> <p>Staff finds the proposed alterations in-keeping with the guidelines, as the new windows will be based on the design of the original, and the alteration of window sizes will occur on secondary elevations of the sunroom.</p> <p>One door on the east elevation's first story will be converted to a window. The original masonry opening will be maintained with a frame infill below the new windowsill. Staff supports this alteration and notes that it will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the new windows be wood or aluminum clad wood with simulated divided lights.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the window trim, sills, and fluted mullions match the original as closely as possible in design and dimension.</u></p>
Standards for Rehabilitation. Residential Construction, pg. 59	<p><i>7. Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i></p>	<p>While the application submitted only covers the rehabilitation of the extant, rear frame portion of the budling, the primary portion of the building and a rear garage appear to be intact. <u>Staff recommends that all exterior material and building elements on the primary building and rear garage be repaired/retained including wooden architectural elements, roofing materials, windows, doors, railings, etc. Any alterations or replacement of any exterior elements on the primary portion of the building or the rear carriage house must be submitted in a subsequent COA application for commission or staff review prior to completing work.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1. 1212 West Franklin Street façade, July 2025.



Figure 2. 1212 West Franklin Street rear. View of sunroom, porch, and garage from the alley. July 2025.



Figure 3. 1212 W. Franklin Street. Current condition of rear, second story sunroom. July 2025.