

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
June 28, 2016 Meeting**

7. **CAR No. 16-092** (K. Johnston)

**800 North 22nd Street
Union Hill Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Rehabilitate an existing home to include new fiber cement siding, windows, railings, and fence and enclosure of an existing first floor porch.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate elements of the exterior of a Colonial Revival home in the Union Hill Old and Historic District at the corner of North 22nd and Cedar Streets. Specifically, the applicant proposes the following work:

- **Roof:** Recoat the existing metal front porch roof. Replace the membrane roof with TPO. Maintain the existing polychrome slate false mansard roof.
- **Siding:** Remove the existing aluminum and asphalt siding. Install smooth fiber cement siding in Iron Gray which is similar to Caviar (#37) in the Commission's Paint Palette.
- **Windows and Doors:** Remove all existing windows. The applicant proposes to install aluminum clad wood windows with the same 2/2 configuration. Specifically, the applicant proposes the followings:
 - **Front Elevation:** Replace 2nd story windows with windows to fit the existing opening. Elongate the window openings on the 1st floor to the original length and install new windows.
 - **North Elevation:** Maintain existing eastern most openings and install new windows on the 1st and 2nd floor. Enclose the remaining two ranked window openings on this façade. Install a new smaller window at the rear of this façade.
 - **South Elevation:** Maintain existing eastern most openings and install new windows on the 1st and 2nd floor. Remove the remaining windows and install four pairs of ranked windows as a part of the proposed porch enclosure.
 - **Rear Elevation:** Enclose both existing openings on the 2nd floor. Alter existing first floor window opening to accommodate a smaller window. Install new French doors into new enclosed porch.
- **Porch Enclosure:** Enclose 80 square feet at the rear corner of the south elevation. Install applied wood columns and wainscoting in addition to four windows on both the 1st and 2nd floors.

- **Fences:** Install a picket fence along front of the property and along Cedar Street terminating at the front of the proposed porch enclosure. At that point the fence would then gradually increase in height to a 6 foot privacy fence which would wrap around the rear of the property.
- **Patio:** Install a stamped concrete patio at the rear of the home and concrete stairs and stoop at the French doors to access the patio.
- **Front Porch:** Install wooden Richmond rail on the front porch.
- **Mechanical Equipment:** Install mechanical equipment on the roof to be screened by wooden lattice.
- **Paint:** In addition to the siding being Iron Gray, the applicant proposes to paint the trim ivory white and the siding Classic Yellow (#44 on the Commission's Paint Palette).

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with conditions.

Roof: The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that original roof shape, size, materials and related elements should be maintained (pg. 55, #4). As the applicant is proposing to retain the visible and character defining features of the false mansard roof and the metal porch roof, staff recommends approval of the proposed roof work.

Siding: The *Guidelines* note that fiber cement siding is a product with limited applications which includes being used on secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right of way (pg 56). As the existing property is a corner lot, both the front elevation and the side elevation that fronts Cedar Street are highly visible primary elevations. The applicant is proposing to install fiber cement siding on all elevations including these primary elevations. Staff recommends the condition of the wood siding beneath the synthetic siding be assessed in coordination with CAR staff; and if possible, a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged and installed with the historic reveals on the front and Cedar Street facing façades. Staff supports the installation of fiber cement siding on the secondary elevations with the condition that the siding be installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal and be smooth and unbeaded.

Windows and Doors: The *Guidelines* state that all original windows should be retained and the number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows, or installing inappropriately sized replacement sashes (pg. 65 #1, #8). On the front façade, staff supports the restoration of the window openings to their original size on the first floor. The *Guidelines* note that original windows should be repaired by patching, splicing, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing (pg. 65, #6). Staff recommends the 2nd floor windows on the front façade and the eastern most ranked windows on the north elevation be repaired rather than replaced as these windows appear to be original, in working order, and on primary elevations. Staff

supports the new windows at the rear of the Cedar Street elevation as these windows provide transparency and relate to the original condition of the structure which included a 2 story inset porch.

The *Guidelines* note that changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows on secondary elevations will be considered on a case-by-case basis (pg. 65, #8). The existing windows on the rear façade do not appear original to the house as they have a 6/6 configuration. Staff supports altering these openings as the existing windows are not original and the elevation will be minimally visible from the public right of way after the installation of the proposed privacy fence. The *Guidelines* note that the architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows (pg. 65 #10). As the new proposed window on the north façade is not consistent in size with windows on the subject building, staff recommends denial of this new smaller second story window and encourages the applicant to maintain both pairs of existing ranked window openings on this elevation. Staff recommends approval of the proposed replacement windows on the north elevation as the visible windows appear to not be original to the structure.

Staff recommends all replacement windows be simulated or true divided lite wood or aluminum clad wood windows.

Porch Enclosure: The *Guidelines* state that porch enclosures are only appropriate on secondary elevations and note that glass enclosure which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred. Per the Sanborn maps, the structure was developed with a two story side porch in the location of the first story porch. As the proposed enclosure is primarily glass and includes decorative porch elements of applied columns and wainscoting, staff supports the proposed porch enclosure.

Fences and Patio: The *Guidelines* state that new fences should be constructed using materials and designs appropriate to the Old and Historic District and that rear-yard privacy fences should mimic traditional fence designs (pg. 74, #4, #7). The proposed fence is constructed of wood and replicates the existing rear privacy fences and front yard picket fences found in the Old and Historic District. Though the applicant has provided a photograph of a fence which rises from a picket fence to a privacy fence, this existing fence is outside of the Old and Historic District. As the proposed sloping fence is not a typically form found in the Old and Historic District, staff recommends the fence should abruptly transition from a picket fence to a privacy fence as is the more common condition with fences in the Old and Historic District. As the *Guidelines* note that fences along main thoroughfares shall be painted or opaquely stained color to complement the colors of the main house, staff recommends the fence be painted or opaquely stained a color to complement the colors of the main house as the proposed fence fronts both 22nd and Cedar Streets. As the proposed patio will not be visible from the public right of way when the fence is constructed and is constructed of a material found in patios in the Old and Historic District, staff supports its installation.

Front Porch: The *Guidelines* note that balusters in traditional Richmond rail are appropriate in locations where there is no evidence of a previous railing (pg. 46, Porches and Porch Details #2). For this reason, staff supports the installation of the proposed railings on the front porch.

Mechanical Equipment: The *Guidelines* state that rooftop HVAC units should be located so that they are minimally visible from the public right-of-way, and screening should be considered (pg. 64, HVAC Equipment #2). The applicant is proposing to locate the mechanical units as far from the front and Cedar Street façades as possible in order to limit the impact on the primary elevations and is also proposing to screen the equipment with lattice. Staff supports the proposed mechanical equipment installation.

Paint: The *Guidelines* note that appropriate paint schemes for Colonial Revival structures are softer colors for the walls and white and ivory for the trimwork (pg. 58). For this reason staff recommends denial of using the Iron Gray Hardieplank as dark gray is not an appropriate color for the Colonial Revival home, and staff recommends the applicant paint the body of the structure a color, to be reviewed and administratively approved by staff, more appropriate for the style of the dwelling. Staff recommends approval of the proposed trim and door colors.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted conditions, is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction in Sections 30-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.