



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

4. COA-125155-2023	Final Review Meeting Date: 2/28/2023
Applicant/Petitioner	Brad & Gabriel Olmstead
Project Description	Various exterior alterations.
Project Location	
Address: 610 N. 27 TH Street	
Historic District: Church Hill North	
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes several exterior alterations to a ca. 1880 frame vernacular Greek Revival dwelling.</p> <p>Exterior alterations include the replacement of wood and aluminum siding with fiber cement siding on secondary elevations; replacement of non-original and original windows with new wood windows; the creation and removal of secondary elevation windows; and the reinstallation of missing corbels on the front façade cornice.</p>	
Staff Recommendation	Partial Approval
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov , (804) 646-6569
Previous Reviews	None.
Conditions for Approval	<p>Staff <i>recommends denial</i> of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replacement of the front three second-story windows • Aluminum wrapping of existing window frames <p>Staff recommends <i>approval</i> of the following:</p> <p>North Elevation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The infilling of the second-story double-hung window and the replacement of the first-floor double hung window with a new double-hung wood window • The new transom window <p>South Elevation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The infilling of the two transom windows and the replacement of two double-hung windows with new wood-

	<p>double hung windows</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> the installation of a new second-story, double-hung window <p>Rear Elevation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The replacement of two rear vinyl windows with new double-hung wood windows. <p>Front Façade:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reinstallation of missing corbels with the condition that the corbels be replaced to match the remaining corbels in design and dimension, and that final design details and replication method be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. <p>Siding:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the siding on the north and south elevations with fiber cement siding with the condition that the siding be smooth, un-beaded, and does not feature a faux wood grain. Front façade wood siding be repaired and replaced in-kind as needed.
--	--

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for Rehabilitation, pg. 59	<i>5. Retain original windows including both functional and decorative elements such as frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, hood molds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, shutters and exterior blinds.</i>	<p>Front Façade</p> <p>The applicant proposes to remove three original 2/2 second-story windows and to replace them with new double hung wood windows. The applicant submitted images that demonstrate these windows are in need of repair; however, the windows do not appear to be beyond repair. <u>Staff recommends denial of the replacement of the front three windows, and recommends that they be repaired rather than replaced.</u></p> <p>North Elevation</p> <p>Applicant proposes to remove two double hung vinyl windows, one on the first-floor and one on the second-floor. The window on the second floor will in infilled, and the window of the first-floor will be replaced. <u>Staff recommends approval of the infilling of the north elevation's second-story double-hung window and the replacement of the north façade's first-floor double hung window with a new double-hung wood</u></p>

		<p><u>window, as these windows are minimally visible and supports their removal.</u></p> <p>Applicant proposes to install one new transom window. <u>Staff recommends approval of the new transom window on the north elevation,</u> as the north elevation is minimally visible and the window will be set far back on the side elevation.</p> <p><u>South Elevation</u></p> <p>Applicant proposes to remove four vinyl windows. The two second-story transom windows will be infilled and the two double-hung windows on the first-floor will be replaced with double-hung wood windows. <u>Staff recommends approval of the infilling of the south façade’s two transom windows and the replacement of two double-hung windows with new wood-double hung windows, as this façade is minimally visible and contains a fenestration pattern not original to the dwelling.</u></p> <p>Applicant proposes to install a new double-hung wood window on the second-floor. <u>Staff supports the installation of a new double-hung window on second-floor of the south elevation,</u> as this elevation is minimally visible, and the window will be set far back on the side elevation.</p> <p><u>Rear Façade</u></p> <p>The applicant proposes to remove two existing vinyl windows, one on the first-floor and one on the second-floor, and to replace them with new double-hung wood windows. <u>Staff recommends approval of the replacement of two rear vinyl windows with new double-hung wood windows.</u></p>
<p>Window Repair, pg. 69</p>	<p><i>6. Original windows should be repaired by patching, splicing, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing them. (The presence of rotted or decayed wood can be determined by jabbing an ice pick into wet wood at an angle and prying up a small section of the wood or by inserting the ice pick perpendicular to the wood. Sound wood will separate in long splinters, decayed wood in short irregular pieces, and penetration of less than one-</i></p>	<p>The applicant proposes to replace three original 2/2 wood windows on the second-floor of the front façade. Images submitted demonstrate that the windows are in need of repair; however the wood doesn’t appear to be rotted or decaying.</p>

	<i>eighth of an inch means the wood is solid.)</i>	
Window Replacement and/or Reconstruction, pg. 69	<p><i>7. Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.</i></p> <p><i>8. The number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows or by installing replacement sash that do not fit the original window. Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis</i></p> <p><i>10. The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings.</i></p>	<p><u>Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the submitted non-original windows on the dwelling</u>, as the new windows will be wood and have a simple they will be a simple design that is compatible with the district.</p> <p>The window schedule and specifications state that window trim will be wrapped in aluminum. Staff believes that aluminum wrapping will alter the appearance and reveal of the historic window framing. <u>Staff recommends denial of the use of aluminum wrapping, and recommends that the window framing and sills be properly painted and sealed.</u></p>
Standards for Rehabilitation, Residential Construction, pg. 59	<p><i>10. While it is acceptable to use salvaged materials as in-kind replacement, adding features or salvaged architectural elements that suggest an inaccurate or undocumented sequence of construction should be avoided because this confuses our understanding of the evolution of Richmond's historic built environment.</i></p>	<p>The front façade cornice is missing several corbels. The applicant is proposing to reinstall new corbels; however, the design submitted doesn't reflect the corbels historic design. <u>Staff recommends approval of the reinstallation of missing corbels with the condition that the corbels be replaced to match the remaining corbels in design and dimension, and that final design details and replication method be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
Administrative Approval Guidelines, Siding Replacement	<p><i>1. Fiber Cement Siding</i></p> <p><i>The replacement of wood siding with fiber cement siding may be approved administratively if the following criteria are met:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>• Smooth, unbeaded fiber cement siding is installed on the secondary elevations only. Textured siding should not be</i> 	<p>Existing wood and Masonite siding on secondary south elevation and aluminum siding on the secondary north elevation is proposed to be replaced with James Hardi fiber cement siding. Staff finds that the north and south elevations have limited visibility from the public right-of-way and feature some siding that is not original to the dwelling. <u>Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the siding on the north and south elevations with fiber cement siding</u></p>

	<p><i>used, including faux wood grain finishes.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Secondary elevations have limited visibility from the public right-of-way.</i> • <i>A sufficient amount of existing wood siding is salvaged and installed with the historic reveals on the façade, or wood siding is replaced in-kind on the front façade.</i> • <i>Reveals of the new siding match the historic reveals.</i> • <i>The siding is painted a color or colors found on the Commission's paint palette.</i> 	<p><u>with the condition that the siding be smooth, un-beaded, and doesn't feature a faux wood grain.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the front wood siding be repaired and replaced in-kind as needed.</u></p>
--	---	---

Figures

Figure 1. 610 N. 27th, front façade



Figure 2. 610 N. 27th, south facade



Figure 3. 610 N. 27th, north façade



Figure 4.

