

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, October 24, 2023

3:30 PM

Virtual Meeting Link: <https://tinyurl.com/mr2yybyk>

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2023.068](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of
Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30p.m.

Roll Call

- Present --** 7 - * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, *
Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, *
Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , * Commissioner John Grier and *
Commissioner Larry Nutt
- Absent --** 1 - * Commissioner Mitch Danese

OTHER BUSINESS

Secretary Dandridge presented the Secretary's Report. At the September CAR Meeting, the Commission denied the project at 211 North 27th Street. The applicant/owner filed an Appeal for the project. The next step is having a council member sponsor the project. If sponsored, the Appeal will be presented for the Land Use and Transportation Committee next.

Secretary Dandridge asked about scheduling a meeting to discuss the Paint Palette. Members of the Commission agreed January 2024 would be a good time for a meeting due to scheduling difficulties during the holidays. Mr. Wheeler said he will not be available for the January Quarterly meeting. The January Quarterly meeting will be January 9, 2024. Commissioner Morgan said if the December CAR Agenda is light, we could possibly include the Paint Discussion in the December meeting.

Secretary Dandridge showed and explained the components for a Window conservation handout that staff was creating. He explained he wants to create handouts for other common maintenance issues. Commissioner Brewer asked about distribution of the flyer. Secretary Dandridge said he would like the handouts to be available online. Suggestions and feedback on the draft window conservation handout were requested from the Commissioners before the December meeting. Other possible maintenance topics may include masonry, porches, siding, and graffiti abatement.

Approval of Minutes

Secretary's Report

Administrative Approvals Report

Enforcement Report

Paint

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Moore to move 2018 East Broad Street to the Consent Agenda. The applicant for 2018 East Broad Street spoke and asked about painting the front section of the building. Commissioner Wheeler asked if the applicant would like to wait and have the property discussed on the regular agenda or have it approved without discussion on the Consent Agenda. The applicant said he wanted the project approved. Commissioner Morgan recused herself. All other Commission members voted in favor of moving 2018 East Broad Street to Consent agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to move 211 North 18th Street to the Consent Agenda. Mr. Moore asked if the applicant is alright with Staff Conditions. The applicant said yes. All commission members voted in favor of moving 211 North 18th Street to the Consent Agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to move 3307 East Marshall Street to the Consent Agenda. Commissioner Pearson recused himself. Commissioner Wheeler asked the applicant if he is alright with the staff conditions. The applicant said yes and that he had spoken with Secretary Dandridge.

1. [COA-137318-2023](#) 411 Brook Road - Alter an existing front façade door opening.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve this application for the reasons state in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

If a new front door is installed, it meets the administrative approval guidelines for front door replacement and be submitted for administrative review and approval; and that the final step material (wood, stone, concrete) be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

2. [COA-137122-2023](#) 1142 W. Grace Street - Alter an existing brick retaining wall, adding stairs; install front and side yard hardscaping.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve this application as submitted for the reasons state in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

5. [COA-137123-2023](#) 2018 E. Broad Street - Rehabilitate an existing auto-garage and surrounding site.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

the front brick addition remain unpainted; that all painted masonry be professionally and gently cleaned before the start of any paint projects; final paint colors be submitted for administrative approval; final garage door materials and colors be submitted for administrative approval; final materials and colors of the new pedestrian doors be submitted for administrative approval; final signage for the building meet the Standards for Signage in the Guidelines, and the final design be submitted for administrative approval; final materials and colors for the fence be submitted for administrative approval; actual brick be used as pavers rather than stamped, colored concrete; final hardscaping materials submitted for administrative approval; brick repairs be completed in-kind, matching the color, composition, and mortar joint profiles to the original as closely as possible; and any subsequent conditions issued by the National Park Service or DHR in compliance with the Historic Tax Credit regulations be submitted for administrative approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

6. [COA-137154-2023](#) 211 N. 18th Street - Add new windows to a garage and paint exterior.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

That the 1994 second story addition be painted a different color than the original masonry portion as a means to differentiate the two sections and better portray the visual history of development of the property.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

8. [COA-137151-2023](#) 3307 E. Marshall Street - Add a roof to a rear, second-story deck.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

The aluminum posts be finished in a way that is not reflective, but matte; final color selections submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the underside (ceiling) of the new roof be a matte, non-reflective finish; final color selections submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; final gutter and downspout product specifications submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

REGULAR AGENDA

3. [COA-098251-2021](#) 3302-3308 E. Marshall St. - Revision to previously issued COA to demolish and reconstruct two, one-story commercial storefronts originally proposed for rehabilitation.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Plans for this project were reviewed and approved by the CAR in 2021. The amended application focuses the reconstruction of the two storefronts that were demolished at the end of August 2023. The new construction portion of the proposal has not been altered since 2021 and will include a small-scale 2-story building on either side of the reconstructed buildings.

The 2021 approved plans called for the rehabilitation of the storefronts at 3304 and 3306 E. Marshall Street. The Commissioners asked for the two historic storefronts to be saved and incorporated into the plans. Plans were revised and new plans were approved by the Commission.

The two storefronts were demolished illegally in the end of August 2023.

Commissioner Wheeler asked for clarification on the wording of the COA application. He said the Commission would not approve the demolition. Commissioner Rodriguez asked for clarification on the violation.

Secretary Dandridge explained that if the project is approved, the property will no longer be in violation, as the abatement would be the reconstruction of the demolished storefronts.

Commissioner Wheeler asked about approving the reconstruction and demolition separately.

Commissioner Pearson and Commissioner Wheeler agreed the Commission should approve the New Construction and Reconstruction, not the Demolition.

Commissioner Wheeler wanted to see the violation still active, until the demolished buildings had been reconstructed.

Ms. Jennifer Mullin was hired as the attorney to represent the project. She said the engineers had planned to stabilize the facades, but believed components of the structure were unsafe.

Mr. Todd Dykshorn is the architect hired for the project, explained that he wants the project to keep the scale of the historic buildings.

During the public comment period, Mr. Alan Rosenbaum, a neighbor on the block, expressed concern with the project. He thought the design is problematic and that the design and project should all be re-considered.

Ms. Cyane Crump, Director of the Historic Richmond Foundation, also spoke on this item and expressed that it is important to think about the precedent that could be set by the Commission in the way that they vote on this item. Crump worried what could happen if the project is not completed as planned.

Ms. Blythe King, a neighbor on the block, spoke during public comment and believed that the buildings torn down were an important part of the built landscape. She contemplated how the lost buildings should be honored.

Mr. Matthew Logan, a neighbor on the block spoke during the public comment period and thought that a new project should be proposed for the site. He believed that the site should be better cleaned.

Commissioner Moore made a motion to approve the application with staff conditions. Commissioner Brewer seconded the motion.

Commissioner Moore believed that three 1-story buildings provide character to the neighborhood. Without better consequences in place, the CAR should try to put the best project forward.

Commissioner Wheeler stated that as Chair, it would have been inappropriate to make a motion; however, if he did he would suggest approving the new construction and denying the demolition.

Commissioner Rodriguez said she agrees with Commissioners Moore and Wheeler. She thinks a line item should be added, that we do not approve demolition. She thinks the design and project are fine as submitted. The Commissioners discussed the wording of the COA.

Ms. Mullin (the lawyer for the project) said the applicant cannot receive a building permit for a Partial Approval.

Commissioner Moore asked staff about the violation. Secretary Dandridge said, "With the violation in place, we cannot issue Administrative Approvals or Building Permits for the property."

Commissioner Pearson stated he wants to see the project move forward; however, worries about this project setting a bad precedent for future developers.

Commissioner Rodriguez stated, "The applicant said they cannot receive a Building Permit for Partial Approval. If wording is changed, could the applicant get approval?"

Mr. Neil Gibson, City Attorney, said he is unsure of this case, as he is not familiar with the Building Reviewer's process and requirements. Commissioner Pearson thinks all the wording of the COA is strange. He said, "No Retroactive Demolition Permit, but it is a Retroactive COA? It does not make sense."

Commissioner Moore made a new motion to remove the language about approving the demolition and approving the project to move forward. Commissioner Wheeler seconded the motion.

Commissioner Morgan questioned the process for this property.

Commissioner Nutt asked if the Commission is ignoring the violation for the property.

Secretary Dandridge said approving the project will abate the violation.

Commissioner Morgan asked if a statement could be added to the conditions of approval that read, "The Commission does not approve the demolitions of the two storefronts at 3304 and 3306 East Marshall Street.

All the Commissioners in the room approved the new motion for the project.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

That the salvaged brick be incorporated into the reconstructed store fronts; reference to the demolition of 3304 and 3306 East Marshall Street be removed from the application; and the Commission of Architectural Review notes that they did not support the demolition of the 3304-3306 East Marshall Street.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Larry Nutt

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

4. [COA-134295-2023](#) 2519 E. Grace Street - Install a metal pergola in a rear yard.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mrs. Abigail Leonard, one of the owners of the property, spoke about the project. She explained that she and her husband heard from neighbors and made revisions to the

project in response to their concerns. New taller trees were added in response to the neighbors' concerns. This is also the reason for adding the proposed trellis around the pergola. The owners wanted privacy and not for the pergola to appear obtrusive.

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

The ceiling of the pergola be finished or painted with a matte color/material; final solution to be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; that the trellis be painted a color that compliments the pergola and primary building; final color selection and trellis design submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; that any future lighting associated with the pergola be compatible with the scale and size of the structure and be down lit and shielded from the adjacent right-of-way and properties; final design of any future lighting be submitted to Staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

7. [COA-137121-2023](#) 313 N. 32nd Street - Replace an existing concrete curb and stairs with brick.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant was not present for the hearing.

Commissioner Wheeler thinks the applicant should consider adjusting the size/length of the front porch steps, instead of changing the historic concrete steps and curb.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to defer the application to allow the applicant to reassess the project and to be present for the hearing.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Larry Nutt

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. [COA-137124-2023](#) 2417-2421 Carrington Street - Demolish a historic frame dwelling and construct six single family dwellings as three semi-attached pairs.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Existing Conditions](#)
[Staff Report](#)

2417 Carrington Street was built around 1880. The original materials on the exterior of

the house have been replaced, and the house is in poor condition. There is a rear addition which dates to the 1920s. The roof of the rear addition slopes toward the main dwelling which has been problematic in the deterioration of the property due to water runoff and infiltration. The exterior has a mix of materials including T111, horizontal paneled siding, and a thick tarp which covers portions of the rear addition.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if the house was currently lived in, and whether or not the city can determine if a building is safe to inhabit.

Secretary Dandridge explained that the City the Building Commissioner can determine livability of a building, and when a property has deteriorated to the point of becoming a health and safety hazard to the public.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if there will be three separate applications for three different parcels?

Secretary Dandridge said staff has not determined how the final application will be presented.

Mr. Gillette, the applicant for the project, explained that the interior of the house has had many modifications. In 2018, the house had Code Violations. The house does have some original lap siding; however it is covered by layers of other types of siding. . The new dwellings proposed for the site will be compatible in style. The new units proposed for 2421-2423 Carrington Street will be on the street corner. Historically, there were two houses on this lot. 2417.5-2419.5 Carrington will be small for-sale houses. The project will require a Special Use Permit. Mr. Gillette has already reviewed the project proposal with the Land Use team, and they approve of the proposal. The applicant wants guidance on materials and colors. The SUP Waiver will consider lot depth and constructing dwellings that front the alley.

Ms. Nancy Lampert, of Union Hill, questions if demolition should be allowed. She mentioned several properties in the district that were in poor condition but were rehabilitated. She recommended rehabilitating the property and completing the new construction portion of the project around it.

Mr. John Travis, a neighbor who lives across the street, said he knew the previous owner of 2417 Carrington Street. He said the previous owner had lived there over 50 years. Travis supported keeping the property and possibly having two to three houses on the lots, instead of six. He mentioned that parking in the neighborhood is terrible.

Commissioner Morgan does not support Demolition of the property.

Commissioner Rodriguez questioned the condition of the property.

Mrs. Chen said the Building Commissioner could make a full analysis of the property.

Commissioner Wheeler said the applicant should hire a third-party engineer to do a full report of the property's conditions.

Commissioner Pearson stated, "I have been involved with a full-scale gutted-renovation on S Street. In comparison to other buildings I have seen, this house appears pristine."

Commissioner Moore said he thinks it is worth looking at more buildings in the area for the project designs. He said inset entrances are not common. Porches are common on the block and should be incorporated.

The builder for the project commented that he does not like inset entrances. He explained the plans are concepts, to see how the buildings could fit on the lots.

Commissioner Rodriguez agrees with staff and does not like the bay windows on the smaller units.

Commissioner Morgan wants to see a Quantitative Structure Report completed for 2417 Carrington Street. How much rot is present in the building? How much moisture damage is present in the building? She wants to know if the buildings can be built at a smaller scale.

Commissioner Grier wants to know how much of the house is salvageable. He explained a project he had worked on, and only the balloon frame structure was saved as part of the project.

Commissioner Brewer wants to know how livable the current property remains.

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:22p.m.