

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
September 27, 2016 Meeting**

9. **CAR No. 16-133** (H. Ingalls) **3003 East Marshall Street
St. John's Church Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Rehabilitate an existing home to include replacing vinyl siding on the rear and side elevations with fiber cement siding, installing a new porch roof, and constructing an addition at the rear and construct a garage at the rear of the property.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate and construct an addition to a semi attached frame dwelling constructed ca. 1895 in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District Old and Historic District. Additionally, the applicant proposes to construct a garage at the rear of the property.

The existing structure is a two story frame structure with a shed roof and a single story extension at the rear with a small inset porch on the western elevation. On the façade, the applicant is proposing to replace the failing porch roof with a new TPO roof and replace the existing front door with a wood half lite door. On the west side elevation, the applicant is proposing to replace the existing vinyl siding with 8" fiber cement lapped siding. Additionally on the west side elevation, the applicant proposes to replace a 1st story door with a 1/1 wood window of the same size and at the same head height of the adjacent window and replace an existing 6/6 replacement window on the 2nd story with a 1/1 wood window in the same opening.

The applicant proposes to construct a two story addition at the rear of the structure which will incorporate the existing single story extension. The proposed addition will be clad in the same fiber cement siding as the original structure. The proposed elevations include ranked 1/1 windows of the same size on the rear and side elevations though the fenestration pattern presented in the elevations does not agree with the floor plans. The applicant proposes to incorporate the addition's roof into the existing shed roof without altering the historic roof form.

At the rear of the property the applicant is proposing to construct a single car garage. The proposed garage will be 16' by 20' with a height of 11' at the alley. The structure will have a shed roof and will be clad in smooth fiber cement siding with an 8" reveal. Details of the proposed garage door have not been provided for review.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions.

Rehabilitation of the existing structure: The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that vinyl siding should

not be used in the City Old and Historic Districts (pg. 45, Materials & Color #4) and that fiber cement siding is a product with limited applications which includes being used on secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right of way (pg. 56). The applicant proposes to remove the inappropriate vinyl siding and install fiber cement siding on a side elevation that is minimally visible from the public right of way. Staff recommends approval of the installation of the fiber cement siding with the condition that the siding be smooth and unbeaded and the applicant submit the proposed color to staff for administrative review and approval.

The Guidelines note that membrane roofs are acceptable substitutes for flat-lock seamed metal roofs (pg. 46, Porch and Porch Details #5). For this reason, staff supports the installation of a membrane roof on the porch with the condition that that proposed membrane be black or gray in color.

The *Guidelines* state that though the number and location of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis (pg. 65, #8). Staff supports the modification of the existing door opening to a window opening as the side elevation is a secondary elevation with minimal visibility from the public right of way.

Building Addition: The *Guidelines* state that additions should be subordinate to the primary structure and as inconspicuous as possible (pg. 44, #1). The proposed addition is at the rear of the home and is less area than the primary structure. The Guidelines note that new construction should be discernible from the old (pg. 44). Staff has concerns that the new construction will not be discernible from the old as the side wall will be incorporated into the existing structures wall. Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition with the condition that the addition be set back from the existing building walls. Additionally as the proposed fenestration pattern on the elevations is not consistent with the floor plans, staff recommends the applicant submit revised floor plans which are consistent with the proposed elevations.

Garage: The Guidelines note that garages should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection; respect the design of outbuildings in the neighborhood; and should be located in the rear (pg. 48, Residential Outbuildings #1-3). The proposed out building will be clad in the same material as the primary structure and have the same shed roof form, is similar to the garage on the adjacent property, and is located at the rear of the property. Staff recommends approval of the garage with the conditions that the siding be smooth and unbeaded with a color to be submitted to staff for review and approval and the details of the garage door be submitted to staff for review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted conditions, is consistent with the Standard for Rehabilitation and New Construction in

Sections 30-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.