



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, September 25, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Call to Order

James Klaus, the Chairman, called the September 25th meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review to order at 3:30 pm.

Roll Call

- Present --** 8 - * Commissioner David C. Cooley, * Commissioner Sanford Bond, * Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, * Commissioner James W. Klaus, * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler and * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- Absent --** 1 - * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Approval of Minutes

August 28, 2018

A motion was made by Commissioner David C. Cooley, seconded by Commissioner Sean Wheeler, that the August minutes be approved. The motion carried with the following vote:

- Aye --** 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Administrative Approval Guidelines

Review of National Register Nominations

Manchester Historic District Boundary Expansion

Ms. Jones stated that the Manchester Historic District Boundary Expansion increases the existing Manchester Historic District to include 104 buildings, with 84 buildings contributing to the district's significance and 20 non-contributing buildings. The period of significance for the district extends from 1900 to 1965, and it is being listed under Criteria A for Commerce and C for Architecture.

Blackwell Historic District

Ms. Jones stated that the Blackwell Historic District consists of 405 buildings, with 241 contributing to the district's significance and 164 non-contributing buildings. The period of significance for the district extends from 1870 to 1968, and it is being listed for significance under Commerce, Education, Ethnic Heritage for African Americans, Social

History, and Architecture. Ms. Jones added that the DHR board has delayed the public hearing for the nominations until October 10th at 1 p.m. at 900 Decatur Street.

Chairman Klaus suggested reiterating the previous comments made by the Commission regarding the former Manchester Historic District expansion which remained relevant. Chairman Klaus stated that the Commission recognizes the historic significance of buildings within the Blackwell and Manchester Historic Districts, further admitting, however, that the Commission's approval is limited to this general recognition of the historic significance of certain buildings. Ms. Morgan, also, expressed her support for the recognition of additional historic contexts for the Blackwell and Manchester districts.

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Jones introduced Planner I, Alex Dandridge, to the Commission of Architectural Review, noting that he would be supporting both the Commission of Architectural Review and the Urban Design Committee.

Ms. Jones announced that the Commission's Quarterly meeting would be held at 6 pm. on October 9th, 2018. To ensure a parking and handicap accessible location for meeting attendees, Ms. Jones decided to hold the quarterly meeting in the City Hall 5th Floor Conference Room. Ms. Jones further announced that the Commission interviewed more candidates for the Front Desk position.

Ms. Jones stated that she and Chelsea Jeffries have been making changes to the Commission's staff reports and will discuss these changes at the upcoming quarterly meeting. Ms. Jones encouraged Commissioners to share their ideas about the staff reports and to inform her of the topics that they would wish to discuss at the Quarterly Meeting. She further noted that she will be open to all Commissioner suggestions regarding changes to administrative guidelines.

Ms. Jones announced open house discussions of the Richmond Master Plan Update, mentioning that Historic Preservation will be one of the discussed topics at the events.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Jones stated that she would be glad to answer Commissioner questions concerning changes to administrative approval guidelines.

Mr. Cooley expressed concern that Commissioners may lose authority to make decisions that fall within their purview, although he conceded that he approves of streamlining the permitting process. Chairman Klaus assured that the changes to administrative approval guidelines would not cause Commissioners to lose authority over decisions that fall within their purview. He confidently asserted that staff would not be administratively approving what the Commission would not approve.

Mr. Hendricks asked if the Commission will still have the opportunity to review a homeowner's request when staff does not administratively approve a request. Ms. Jones replied that the Commission would continue to have the opportunity to review a request that cannot be administratively approved.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jones announced that staff met with property owners at 2800 East Leigh Street and would be following up with them later in the week. Staff also received complaints about another property at 906 North 24th Street and additional complaints about paint colors and unapproved work at other locations.

Other Committee Reports

There were no Other Committee Reports.

Please Note

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

Chairman Klaus made a motion to move the 3rd item, COA-041211-2018, 2023 West Grace Street to the consent agenda. Mr. Bond seconded the motion. The commission unanimously approved moving the item.

A motion was made by Commissioner James W. Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Sanford Bond, to accept the consent agenda. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 1 [COA-041226-2018](#) 3422 East Broad Street - Alter two window openings and add an opening in the rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: window details be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval prior to installation; the new window align with the door below.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 3 [COA-041211-2018](#) 2023 W. Grace St - Replace two-story deck in rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the applicant submit the railing design for administrative review and approval; the deck and stair structure be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure to be administratively approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

REGULAR AGENDA

- 2 [COA-039802-2018](#) 2708-2712 East Broad Street - Install suspended gutters and downspouts on the front porch of 2708-2712 East Broad Street.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(08/28/2018\)](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report \(08/28/2018\)](#)[Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)[Staff Report \(09/25/2018\)](#)

The applicant, Lizabeth Lefferts, explained to the Commission that three years ago, the previous owner of her property allegedly renovated the porches and allegedly obtained a permit from the city to renovate the porches without installing any gutters. Ms. Lefferts claimed that she only installed k style gutters on her property as an emergency repair after she noticed that the bases of her porch columns were rotting. She further insisted that she is not setting a new precedent by installing k style gutters on her home and cannot afford to install new gutters.

Chairman Klaus expressed sympathy for the financial burden that Ms. Lefferts claimed to suffer, but he expressed even greater concern with approving k style gutters in an area where k style gutters are generally absent, despite admitting that Ms. Lefferts' k style gutters appeared aesthetically acceptable. He acknowledged that the applicant's previous landowner created a problem for her, but this difficulty, to him, did not fully justify a deviation from precedent.

Ms. Lefferts insisted that she cannot afford to remove the k style gutters and install box gutters. She emphasized that her gutters are both aesthetically pleasing and compatible with the historic district, noting that she provided the Commission with pictures of 32 houses in her historic district that have k style gutters installed.

Mr. Cooley asked to see the photographs of the 32 houses in the applicant's historic district that she claimed have k style gutters installed. After looking at the photos that Ms. Lefferts provided, Mr. Cooley suggested that he could accept the applicant's k style

gutters as long as she modified the outside corner of the gutter to prevent it from jutting out. Ms. Lefferts agreed that she could make the suggested adjustment to the gutter.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Cooley and Mr. Hendricks both suggested that if the Commission allows the applicant to keep the k style gutters at the current meeting, the applicant should replace the k style gutters with box gutters whenever the applicant moves forward with porch renovation. Chairman Klaus stood by his opinion that allowing k style gutters would undermine precedent in the historic district and added that homeowners in historic districts need to inform the Commission of desired repairs, even of desired emergency repairs. Chairman Klaus added that he is unable to join Mr. Cooley's position. Ms. Lefferts joined the discussion to protest that she absolutely cannot afford to remove the gutters due to tax increases, decreases in rental income, and the competition in the area. She further alleged that she may need to sell her building if the Commission requires that she remove the k style gutters. Chairman Klaus responded that he acknowledges the situation's difficulty, and Mr. Cooley stated that he is just trying to help someone who is complaining about financial distress because of the guidelines that the Commission is trying to enforce. Mr. Cooley asked Ms. Lefferts if she would be able to replace the k style gutters with box gutters if the Commission gave Ms. Lefferts a year to do so. Ms. Lefferts emphatically insisted that she would be unable to do so, and she stated that she is being burdened by a 45 percent tax increase, adding that she has recently had difficulty renting her units.

Ms. Morgan suggested that installing a half round gutter could be another potential solution. Ms. Lefferts replied that a half round gutter would not be helpful to her. Mr. Hendricks asked Ms. Lefferts if she would be open to a wholehearted promise that she would put the box gutters back into place when the time comes to replace the porch. Ms. Lefferts replied that she could do so. Mr. Hendricks stated that he is open to Mr. Cooley's recommendation with the added condition that Ms. Lefferts switch the gutter to extend back to the main body of the building. Mr. Wheeler asked if the applicant could consider rebuilding a box gutter on top of the existing roof. Ms. Lefferts replied that she does not find rebuilding a box gutter more feasible. Mr. Pearson warned that if the Commission supports Mr. Cooley's suggestion, Ms. Lefferts needs to ensure that there is no encroachment onto the neighboring property when she makes an adjustment to the gutter.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the gutter wrap around 2708 E Broad to meet the face of the house provided it does not create an encroachment on the neighboring property; if the porch is rebuilt a box gutter and downspouts will be installed. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- No --** 3 - Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

- 5 [COA-041213-2018](#) 208 South Boulevard - Demolish an existing garage to construct a new, brick, two-car garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Cooley delineated that the language in the guidelines strongly discourages demolition when demolition is structurally unnecessary but does not explicitly forbid demolition under such circumstances.

The applicant, Greg Allen, admitted that the current single car garage at the site of the proposed construction is in no danger of falling over. Mr. Allen stated that the homeowner would simply like to have a more usable structure that could fit a larger vehicle.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Commissioners acknowledged that it would be difficult to fit a larger car into a single car garage. Chairman Klaus stated that he has no problem with a two car garage and that it seems like there is historic material that could be incorporated into the applicant's design for a two car garage. Commissioners considered whether the applicant would be able to salvage the brick found in the existing garage wall. Mr. Allen assured the Commission that that the two car garage would contain actual brick and that he is open to salvaging existing brick. Mr. Bond stated that a two car garage would fit well with the rest of the alley and that he supports getting another car off the street.

A motion was made by Commissioner Cooley, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: brick from the historic garage be salvaged for use on any visible portions of the new garage.. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer and Commissioner Sean Wheeler
- No --** 2 - Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

6 [COA-036126-2018](#) 2009 Venable Street - Rehabilitate a single family dwelling.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(06/26/2018\)](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report \(06/26/2018\)](#)[Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)[Staff Report \(09/25/18\)](#)

Rob Walker, the applicant, expressed his support for staff recommendations. Mr. Cooley advised Mr. Walker to remove old siding carefully, warning that old siding is much tougher than what can be bought today. Mr. Hendricks and Mr. Cooley further advised the applicant to benefit from any available tax credits.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Commissioners expressed approval for staff recommendations and additional appreciation for the applicant's willingness to abide by

staff recommendations. Mr. Hendricks stated that if there is photographic evidence of the porch details, it would be better for the applicant to conform porch construction to the original design. Ms. Chen confirmed that the porch of the house next to 2009 Venable Street was restored based on physical evidence.

A motion was made by Commissioner Bond, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the condition of the historic siding be assessed in coordination with staff and be salvaged for installation on the facade; and if the siding cannot be salvaged, wood siding with a reveal to match the historic reveal be installed on the facade; the fiber cement siding installed on the secondary elevations be smooth, unbeaded, and with a reveal to match the historic reveal found on the wood siding of the front facade; the color for the siding be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the cornice on the facade be repaired or replaced where necessary with an exact match, in wood; details of any replacement cornice elements be submitted for administrative review and approval; any replacement trim match the existing wood trim; the existing box gutter be repaired and the proposed suspended gutter not be installed; the new windows be 2/2 on the facade and 6/6 on the side and rear and have true or simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar and specifications for the new windows be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; details of the new doors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval prior to installation and the doors fit the existing openings; the transom over the front door remain a single lite, rather than the 3-lite transom depicted in the plans; the front porch be restored to match front porches found on the recently rehabilitated adjacent structures; a porch detail be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; if the porch roof structure is replaced, it match the existing roof rather than the roof depicted in the plans; all replacement materials be wood; the front porch roof be metal with flat seams or be a dark colored membrane roof which . The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 7 [COA-041221-2018](#) 815 North 22nd Street - Rehabilitate a mixed-use building and construct a rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Will Payne, owner representative, expressed his support for staff recommendations.

Nancy Lambert wrote a letter to the Commission, questioning material that the applicant may be using in the construction of the railing. Charlie Field added that although he cannot speak for the whole neighborhood, everyone he knows would be thrilled with the proposed construction.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Chairman Klaus expressed support for the application and disagreed with Ms. Lambert's concern with the railing material,

emphasizing that the application proposes a modern addition. He emphasized that a modern addition to a structure within a historic district does not need to conform to the same limitations as an existing structure within a historic district, and he further expressed support for the applicant's window construction preference, also arguing that the windows were appropriate for a modern addition.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the exterior colors be submitted for staff review and approval; the profile and finish of the corrugated metal panels be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 8 [COA-041509-2018](#) 804 North 22nd Street - Construct a new, two-story, single family detached house on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Matt Jarreau, the applicant, defended the presence of a faux slate roof on the proposed construction. He, additionally, supported the use of PVC clad windows, rather than aluminum clad windows, on the proposed construction, arguing that PVC clad windows were approved in staff recommendations under similar circumstances by the Commission in the past. Chairman Klaus expressed doubt that staff would have recommended PVC clad windows or approved PVC clad windows. Mr. Cooley asked the applicant if he considers PVC clad windows more cost effective than aluminum clad windows. Mr. Jarreau replied that the durability of PVC clad windows, primarily, motivates his strong preference for these types of windows, finding PVC clad windows more reliable than aluminum clad windows.

Charlie Fields encouraged the Commission to consider the visual profile of a window when determining the type of window that would be most appropriate, rather than whether a window is aluminum clad or PVC clad. Mr. Bond agreed that the Commission should be open to evolving its standards as window profiles change over time.

Chairman Klaus stated that the Commission should investigate the position that staff had taken towards PVC clad windows in the past.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the specifications for the windows and roof material be submitted for administrative review and approval; the proposed exterior colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 9 [COA-041237-2018](#) 511 North 21st Street - Construct a two-story porch on the rear and alter the openings on the rear elevation.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(09/25/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Charlie Field, on behalf of the applicant, explained to the Commission that the applicant simply wishes for a porch that would resemble porches in the area and allow for room for a table and chairs. Mr. Field, also, stated that he would wish, when constructing the porch, to drop the beam below the ceiling to create a more traditional-looking porch.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Wheeler stated that he has no issue with the proposed porch depth. Chairman Klaus disagreed, noting that there are few examples of twelve foot two story porches in the historic district. Mr. Hendricks stated that the Commission needs to balance how the porch was used historically against how the porch would be used today. Ms. Morgan stated that she is interested in how the porch roof ties into the existing roof.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred as submitted to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the depth of the proposed porch; the applicant provide additional details about the screening, framing for the porch doors, gutters, and connections of the porch roof to the existing building. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

- 10 [COA-034556-2018](#) 411 Chimborazo Boulevard - Construct a new two story frame garage.

- Attachments:** [Application and Plans \(5/22/2018\)](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report \(5/22/2018\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(6/26/2018\)](#)
[Staff Report \(6/26/2018\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(08/28/2018\)](#)
[Staff Report \(08/28/2018\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)
[Staff Report \(09/25/2018\)](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the depth of the proposed porch; the applicant provide additional details about the screening, framing for the porch doors, gutters, and connections of the porch roof to the existing building. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

4 [COA-041127-2018](#) 515 West Clay Street - Replace wood fence.

- Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

There was no applicant present for this application

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

Conceptual Review

There are no items for conceptual review.

Adjournment

Chairman Klaus adjourned the meeting at 6:48 pm.

