

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, April 22, 2025

3:30 PM

Virtual Meeting Link: <https://tinyurl.com/yx6cucku>

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2025.009](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner John Grier, * Commissioner Mitch Danese, * Commissioner Larry Nutt, * Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, * Commissioner Erik Bootsma, * Commissioner Emily Striffler and * Commissioner Catherine Easterling

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez

Approval of Minutes

There were no minutes for approval.

Secretary's Report

Resolution of Appreciation for Mitchell W. Danese

Approved

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Striffler to approve the Resolution of Appreciation.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: (8) BOOTSMA, DANESE, EASTERLING, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, RODRIGUEZ, STRIFFLER

No: (0)

Absent (1) RODRIGUEZ

Election of Commissioner Bootsma as the new CAR Representative to sit on the Urban Design Committee

Approved

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve Commissioner Erik Bootsma to serve as the new CAR representative on the Urban Design Committee.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: (8) BOOTSMA, DANESE, EASTERLING, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, RODRIGUEZ, STRIFFLER

No: (0)

Absent (1) RODRIGUEZ

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

1. [COA-164401-2025](#) 2614 East Franklin Street - Construct a new 8x14 tool shed.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: Confirm final roofing selection and ensure that, if metal roofing is used, it is of a historically compatible profile (standing seam panels, not corrugated or ribbed panel type; and confirm and abide by any other zoning regulations.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

2. [COA-163028-2025](#) 711 North 26th Street - Demolish an existing one and one half story rear portion of a building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application for the following reasons, followed by conditions:

1. The rear addition has undergone many alterations and was built in a way that causes inherent maintenance issues.
2. There is evidence of deterioration and many replacement materials.
3. A structural engineer's reports indicates that because of the addition's condition, there may not be a feasible alternative to demolition. Rehabilitation would require further removal and alterations to the little historic material that remains.
4. While the addition does contribute the overall historic character of the district, it lacks significant architectural value, unlike the primary massing of building, and is most visible from a secondary public right-of-way.

5. A proposed new addition will reference the existing design and form.

6. The addition maintains few aspects of integrity - maintaining the aspects of Location & Setting; however, the aspects of Design, Materials, and Association have been diminished, and the addition no longer possess the aspects of Workmanship & Feeling.

Commission conditions of approval:

The building permit for the demolition and the associated new construction be applied for simultaneously; and the primary massing on 711 North 26th Street should be protected during the demolition and new construction stages in order to preserve remaining historic material and features.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

3. [COA-163025-2025](#) 711 North 26th Street - Construct a rear two story addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report, provided that the following conditions are met: Applicant clad the addition in horizontal siding with a differing reveal from the primary mass of the building.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

9. [COA-164396-2025](#) 803 North 21st Street - Construct an addition to the rear of a two-story multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: Only horizontal lap siding and applying it uniformly across all façades of the addition; final material specifications submitted for administrative approval; accurate elevations, reflecting actual grade transitions and backyard access be submitted with the final permit plans; and HVAC units be fully screened if visible from the public right-of-way.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

REGULAR AGENDA

4. [COA-162877-2025](#) 815-821 Mosby Street - Construct a new three-story multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions: Applicant submit a site regrading plan with the final plan set to confirm proposed grade conditions and ensure the height of the building will be true to the plans; any new retaining wall should be constructed of materials common in the district such as brick, concrete, or parged block; the parking area behind the building be adequately screened from the public right way with vegetation that reaches an adequate mature height to serve as screening; and final window, door, railing, and cladding material selections be submitted to staff for approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

No -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

5. [COA-164407-2025](#) 212-218 North 20th Street - Construct new 6-unit, 3-story townhouse buildings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Reports](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: Brick wall surrounding the entrance on the façade be removed or replaced with a more transparent material such as a railing, revised drawings submitted to staff for approval. The brick selection be a red color. Final brick and mortar color submitted to staff for approval; the three smaller windows on the third story of the façade be the same size as the larger windows on that façade, revised drawings submitted to staff for approval; and the final design of fencing /screening be submitted for administrative approval if it differs from the current plan.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

No -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

6. [COA-164405-2025](#) 3104 East Broad Street - Alter front elevations, alter paint color, replace windows, demolish portions of side and rear elevation. - WITHDRAWN

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

This application was withdrawn by city staff due to a number of discrepancies in the submitted plans.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn

7. [COA-164406-2025](#) 2716 Monument Avenue - Replace existing slate, front porch roof with a standing seam metal roof.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Easterling, to partially approve this application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: Specifically, the Commission approved the removal of the extant, non-original front porch slate roof. Specifically, the Commission denied the installation of a standing-seam metal roof on the front porch and recommended that the applicant install a flat-lock metal roof instead, which is a material in-keeping with the guidelines for front porch roof replacements.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

8. [COA-164459-2025](#) 510 West 20th Street - Result of a violation: Replace original, deteriorated roofing with a new material.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

This application was withdrawn by the applicant.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

10. [COA-164394-2025](#) 715 Mosby Street - Construct a new 3-story, 22-unit multifamily building with ground floor commercial space.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. Below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

The Commission supported staff's assessment and echoed concerns regarding the lack

of architectural expression and cohesive façade composition.

The Commission encouraged the applicant to look to the district's residential context for design inspiration, emphasizing that the architectural character of the block should inform the massing, detailing, and material selection.

The Commission expressed general support for the inclusion of commercial space on the ground floor, provided that it is better integrated with the building's overall design and engages the street more effectively. Commissioners suggested studying local precedents, including commercial storefronts that wrap around corners.

The Commission supported stepping down the massing toward the alley. Regarding the applicant's question about window adjustments, the Commission clarified that any changes in window sizing must correspond with the overall façade design. The Commission concluded that the current proposal does not meet the historic district guidelines and noted that the design must be refined to include a clearly articulated base, middle, and top, with those elements expressed distinctly in the elevation.

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. Below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

The Commission supported staff's assessment and echoed concerns regarding the lack of architectural expression and cohesive façade composition.

The Commission encouraged the applicant to look to the district's residential context for design inspiration, emphasizing that the architectural character of the block should inform the massing, detailing, and material selection.

The Commission expressed general support for the inclusion of commercial space on the ground floor, provided that it is better integrated with the building's overall design and engages the street more effectively. Commissioners suggested studying local precedents, including commercial storefronts that wrap around corners.

The Commission supported stepping down the massing toward the alley. Regarding the applicant's question about window adjustments, the Commission clarified that any changes in window sizing must correspond with the overall façade design.

The Commission concluded that the current proposal does not meet the historic district guidelines and noted that the design must be refined to include a clearly articulated base, middle, and top, with those elements expressed distinctly in the elevation.

11. [COA-164399-2025](#) 2206 Jefferson Avenue - Construct a two-story single-family detached dwelling on the vacant parcel.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. Below is a brief summary of the Commission's recommendations:

The Commission expressed appreciation for the contemporary approach to the design and its respectful relationship to the character of the block.

The Commission agreed with staff regarding the importance of aligning the cornice height with surrounding buildings and emphasized the need for contextual elevation drawings to confirm this relationship.

While staff recommended reducing the number of windows in the projecting bay, the Commission was not opposed to the inclusion of three windows, noting the resemblance to similar configurations that can be found on historic projecting bays nearby. One suggestion offered was to design the projection with a larger central window flanked by two smaller, symmetrical openings.

The Commission also requested a more detailed and developed design for the porch, including its structural supports and roof covering.

12. [COA-164402-2025](#) 3021 & 3025 East Franklin Street - Construct two single-family attached dwellings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. Below is a brief summary of the Commission's recommendations:

The Commission discussed the disjointed porch design, and further acknowledged the applicant's explanation that porch roofs can no longer cross property lines due to current code restrictions.

In response, the Commission suggested that a simplified single-slope roof could better express continuity between the two porches while respecting the legal separation.

The Commission supported staff's recommendation to remove the connected cornice-window detail and affirmed that such framing should not visually link the window groupings to the framing design.

Regarding the proposed dormers, the Commission noted that it is not necessary for dormer windows to align exactly with the fenestration below, as the roof can read as a separate zone from the primary wall plane.

13. [COA-164398-2025](#) 1924 Princess Anne Avenue - Construct new 3- story Single Family home.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. Below is a brief summary of the Commission's recommendations:

The Commission emphasized the importance of reducing the building height from the proposed three-and-a-half stories to two-and-a-half stories, aligning it with the scale of adjacent contributing dwellings. Commissioners stressed that the building's design should draw inspiration from the immediate streetscape rather than nearby condominium developments, which differ in use and scale. The Commission noted that the proposed central window grouping is too closely clustered, disrupting the façade's balance and symmetry. They recommended

adjusting the fenestration to better reflect the historic window-to-wall ratio typical of Princess Anne Street.

Additionally, the Commission requested more information on the history of the lot.

The Commission also noted that the roof cornice line typically terminates between the second story and the attic level, in keeping with the proportions found on nearby historic dwellings, and reiterated the importance of getting the massing and scale right for compatibility within the block.

The Commission noted the need for a contextually sensitive design for this “missing tooth” on the fully built-out and highly recognizable block.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:26p.m.