



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

8. COA-142638-2024	Conceptual Review	Meeting Date: 2/27/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	James Catts	
Project Description	Construct a new two-story building.	
Project Location		
Address: 4002 Hermitage Road		
Historic District: Hermitage Road		
High-Level Details:		
<p>The applicant proposes to construct a new two-story garage in the rear side yard of an 1870s Queen Anne Style building.</p> <p>The building will be similar in design to the primary building on the site, using a similar massing, cladding, and color.</p> <p>The combined two floors of the garage will be approximately 2,200 square feet.</p> <p>The garage will be approximately 25'8" tall, 26' wide, and 50' long.</p> <p>Preliminary conversations with the Zoning Division indicate that this project may require a Special Use Permit to allow for the proposed height. Additional information will need to be provided to the Zoning Department for a more detailed list of requirements.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Conceptual Review	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, (804) 646-6569, alex.dandridge@rva.gov	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A site plan with the exact footprint of the proposed garage be submitted with labeled setbacks of the proposed building, and the existing buildings on site. • Exterior HVAC equipment be in an area that is minimally visible from the public right-of-way and screened from view; final location shown on a site plan. • The garage should have a consistent window design and light configuration. • The proposed garage reference the design of the existing carriage house more so than the primary building on-site. • The size of the proposed garage be reduced to subordinate it from the primary building. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The heights and dimensions of the existing primary and auxiliary buildings on site be submitted for review. • Applicant continue to work with the Zoning Division to provide them with the necessary materials to determine all zoning requirements that must be met. • Garage doors not feature faux hardware
<p>Surrounding Context:</p> <p>4002 Hermitage Road is located within the Hermitage Road City Old and Historic District as well as the Hermitage Road National Register Historic District. The subject parcel is zoned R-1, residential single-family and is just over one acre (1.1364 acres). The site consists of a primary, frame, two-story, Queen Anne Style building that was constructed ca. 1870 and a secondary 1 ½ story rear carriage house. There appears to be additional smaller auxiliary structures towards the rear alley. On the west side of Hermitage (location of 4002 Hermitage), the block features estate-style, single family dwellings with large front yards, landscaping, and driveways. On the east side of Hermitage Road there are more modestly sized single-family dwellings with smaller front yards and shallower side yard setbacks, which give this side a “denser” appearance. The dwellings on east side of the street are staggered with the curve of the road. There is a religious institution on the west side of the block as well as attached town houses. Most dwellings in the immediate area are two and two and a half stories in height.</p>	

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for New Construction, Siting, pg. 46	<i>2. New residential infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimum setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.</i>	The Hermitage Road City Old and Historic District is characterized by estate-style buildings with large front yards and gardens. The proposed garage will be set back onto the lot farther than the primary building. Exact setback measurements were not provided. <u>Staff recommends that a site plan with the exact footprint of the proposed garage be submitted with labeled setbacks of the proposed building, and the existing buildings on site.</u>
Standards for New Construction, Materials & Colors, pg. 47	<i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</i> <i>5. Rooftop mechanical equipment should be located as discretely as possible to limit visibility. In addition, appropriate screening should be provided to conceal equipment from view. When rooftop railings are required for seating areas or for safe access to mechanical equipment, the railings should be as unobtrusive as possible, in order to minimize their appearance and visual impact on the surrounding district.</i>	<p>The new garage will use materials that are compatible with the primary building and with the context of the district. It will be clad in wood siding and will have a brick foundation. The roof will be slate. The columns, doors, and windows will be wooden and painted/stained to match the primary building.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that exterior HVAC equipment be in an area that is minimally visible from the public right-of-way and screened from view; final location shown on a site plan.</u></p>
New Construction, Windows & Doors, pg. 49	<i>3. The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on free standing, new construction</i>	The proposed garage will feature a variety of windows, most of which will be vertically aligned. Based on the renderings, it appears that the south and east elevations will have one-over-one windows, and the north and west

	<p><i>should be compatible with patterns established within the district.</i></p>	<p>elevations will have windows with margin lights-over-two. These elevations will also feature smaller square windows. It is unclear how visible the smaller square windows will be from the public right-of-way.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the garage have a consistent window design and light configuration.</u> Staff believes that the one-over-one window design is most appropriate for new construction.</p>
<p>New Construction, Residential Outbuildings, pg. 50</p>	<p><i>1. Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos and other auxiliary structures, should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection.</i></p> <p><i>2. Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i></p> <p><i>3. New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary structures.</i></p>	<p>The primary building on site is a two-story, three-bay, simple Queen Anne building with a complex plan ca. 1870. It is clad in dutch-cut lap siding and staggered wood shingles. It has a complex, slate roof with five interior chimneys. Stylistic elements include a full-width, single-story entry porch with balustrades and a pedimented shed roof supported by slender, squared columns. It sits on a deep rectangular lot with a deep setback and an asphalt driveway. The first story is clad in horizontal siding, and the second story is clad in wooden shingles and is separated from the first floor visually with a flared base.</p> <p>On the proposed garage's east elevation, (shorter side) which will face Hermitage Road, it will have a front facing gable roof which relates to the front facing cross gable on the primary building's facade. The west elevation will have a hipped roof. The primary building is a simple Queen Anne style, and the center front gable is one of the more prominent features of the building. Copying this feature on the new building may compete with the design of the primary building.</p> <p>To differentiate the two building's <u>Staff recommends that the proposed garage reference the design of the existing carriage house more so than the primary building.</u> This alteration would further differentiate the proposed garage from the primary building, and it would retain the primary building's front facing cross gable as a prominent feature on the Hermitage Road facing elevations of the two buildings. The existing, large carriage house at the rear of the lot primarily features a hipped roof with a smaller dormer and cupola.</p> <p>The proposed garage will be similar in design, using the same materials, color, and general roof form as the primary building.</p> <p>According to the site plan, the proposed garage will be located towards the rear side yard and will be set back further on the lot than the primary building. The building will be oriented so that the "long side" featuring the garage doors will face the northside of the primary building and the asphalt driveway.</p> <p>While the new garage will be located towards the rear side yard of the property, staff finds that its size is quite large. The proposed new garage will be approximately 2,200 square feet as compared to the primary building which is 3,753 square feet and the existing carriage house which is 1,079 square feet (according to city assessment records).</p>

		<p><u>Staff recommends that the applicant reduce the size of the proposed building to further subordinate it from the primary building.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the heights and dimensions of the existing primary and auxiliary buildings on site be submitted for review.</u></p>
--	--	---

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures

Figure 1. 4002 Hermitage, 2023. View looking west along driveway and side yard.



Figure 2. 4002 Existing Rear Carriage House, 2021. Hipped roof with through-the-eave dormer and cupola. (pre-rehabilitation).



Figure 3. Footprint of existing building.



