

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
August 28, 2018 Meeting**

2. **COA-037946-2018** (D. Cho)

**3309 Monument Avenue
Monument Avenue Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Demolish an existing porch and sunroom to construct a rear addition; construct a 2-car garage.**

Staff Contact: **C. Jeffries**

The applicant requests approval to construct an addition and a garage at a Colonial Revival home built in 1950 in the Monument Avenue Old and Historic District. Though the City Old and Historic Districts do not differentiate contributing and noncontributing properties, the building is listed as a noncontributing resource in the inventory for the Monument Avenue National Historic Landmark Historic District. The applicant proposes the following work:

- Construct a one-story brick two car garage with a metal shed roof in the rear of the property.
- Remove an existing two-story porch and one-story sunroom at the rear of the structure.
- Construct a two-story frame addition at the rear with fiber cement siding, a brick foundation and a synthetic slate or copper roof. The addition will have wood windows to match the existing windows and wood doors.
- Construct a stairway to a second story entrance and entry stairs to a first story entrance on the new addition. The stairs will have treated posts and fir Richmond rail.

The application was reviewed by the Commission at the July 24, 2018 meeting. The Commission deferred the application to allow the applicant the opportunity to provide more detailed plans. The applicant has modified the plans as follows:

- The fixed windows on each of the side elevations were replaced with double hung windows.
- On the rear elevation, a window was removed, a fixed window was replaced with a double hung window, and a single door was changed to double doors.
- The roof material on the addition will be either synthetic slate or copper.
- Floor plans were submitted.

Staff recommends approval of the project, with conditions.

Garage: The proposed garage meets the Commission's Guidelines for outbuildings found on page 51 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* as the garage is subordinate to the primary structure, located at the rear of the primary structure, clad in a material to match the primary structure, and has a roof form consistent with outbuildings in

the district. Staff recommends details of the proposed garage doors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval and the proposed windows be wood or aluminum clad wood with true or simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar.

Demolition: The *Guidelines* state that the Commission can approve requests for demolition when a building or structure is deemed not to be a contributing part of the historic character of a City Old and Historic District (pg. 82, #2). The existing structures at the rear of the home were constructed in 1998 of pressure-treated wood. Staff recommends approval of the proposed demolition.



CAR slides July, 1998

Addition: The *Guidelines* state that additions should not obscure or destroy original architectural elements and should be subordinate in size to their main buildings and locating at the rear is preferred (pg. 46 Siting #1, pg. 47, Materials #1). The proposed addition is at the rear of the structure and is inset from the existing walls by one foot on each side. The addition is further differentiated from the original structure by the fiber cement siding. Staff recommends the siding be smooth and without a bead and colors be submitted for administrative review and approval. The plans indicate that either synthetic slate or copper roofing will be installed on the addition. Staff recommends copper be installed to further differentiate the addition from the existing structure. Details of the roof material should also be submitted to staff for administrative review prior to installation.

Windows and doors: The *Guidelines* state that existing windows should serve as the model for new windows (pg. 69, #10). The applicant has indicated that the new windows will match the existing head and sill heights. Staff notes that though the structure contains a mixture of 6/6 and 8/8 windows, the elevations do not accurately reflect the existing windows. Staff recommends the new windows be wood or aluminum clad wood windows with true or simulated divided lites with a spacer bar between the glass. The windows on the side elevations of the addition should be 6/6 to match the existing side windows. The plans indicate that the new doors on the rear of the addition will have glass though details are not provided. Staff recommends specifications for the doors be submitted for administrative review and approval.

Stairways: Stairways are proposed to access the new entrances on the rear addition. The new structures will be constructed of pressure treated wood with fir Richmond rail. As the stairways are new construction staff has reviewed them against the recommendations for decks found on page 51 of the *Guidelines*. The proposed stairways generally meet the requirements for decks. Staff recommends the entire structure be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color to be administratively approved.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Sections 30-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.