



Staff Report  
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

8. COA-137151-2023	Final Review <span style="float: right;">Meeting Date: 10/24/2023</span>
Applicant/Petitioner	Duncan Reid
Project Description	Add a roof to a rear, second-story deck.
Project Location	
Address: 3307 East Marshall Street	
Historic District: Chimborazo Park	
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The applicant requests approval to construct a roof/canopy structure on a second-story rear deck of a semi-attached masonry building ca. 1910</li> <li>The roof structure will be three-inch thick insulated aluminum supported by 6 x 6 aluminum posts and a heavy horizontal beam.</li> <li>The roof will use box gutters and round down spouts.</li> </ul>	
Staff Recommendation	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, (804) 646-6569, alex.dandridge@rva.gov
Previous Reviews	The Commission reviewed and approved the reconstruction of the existing rear porches at 3305-3307 East Marshall Street in 2015, along with other exterior repairs.
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The aluminum posts be finished in a way that is not reflective, but matte. Final color selections submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</li> <li>The underside (ceiling) of the new roof be a matte, non-reflective finish. Final color selections submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</li> <li>Final gutter and downspout product specifications submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</li> </ul>

## Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
<p><b>Standards for Rehabilitation, Residential New Construction, pg. 59</b></p>	<p><i>7. Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i></p>	<p>The 1952 Sanborn Maps show identical two-story rear porches with roofs at 3305-3311 East Marshall Street. The original porches on all four units appear to have been removed, however the rear porches at 3309-3311 East Marshall Street have been reconstructed to have a similar footprint and location as the original. 3305-3307 East Marshall Street's rear porches have been reconstructed to match the neighboring property, but do not include a roof covering.</p>
<p><b>New Construction, Residential, Materials, pg. 47</b></p>	<p><i>2. Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood.</i></p>	<p>The new roof over the rear porch will have an insulated aluminum roof supported by 6 x 6 aluminum posts and a heavy horizontal beam. This design is similar to that found at 3309-3311 East Marshall Street. Staff believes that the roof will be visually compatible with wood if it has a matte finish. Furthermore, it will be in a minimally visible location on a rear elevation. <u>Staff recommends that the aluminum posts be finished in a way that is not reflective, but matte. Final color selections submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
<p><b>New Construction, Residential, Porches &amp; Porch Detailing, pg. 49</b></p>	<p><i>5. Porch roofs are encouraged to utilize standing- or flat-lock metal seam roofs that are hand-seamed, or closely approximate handseaming. Seams that, in section, are large, rectangular seams, reminiscent of pre-formed seams utilized on prefabricated industrial or commercial structures, are not acceptable. Membrane roofs are acceptable substitutes for flat-lock seamed metal roofs.</i></p>	<p>The new porch roof will be insulated aluminum. Given the height and pitch of the roof, the roofing material will likely not be visible from the rear alley. The appearance of the underside (ceiling) of the roof is unclear. <u>Staff recommends that the underside (ceiling) of the new roof be a matte, non-reflective finish. Final color selections submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
<p><b>Administrative Approval Guidelines for Gutters and Downspouts</b></p>	<p><i>Staff may approve new gutters and downspouts that are needed for proper drainage but were not on the building historically. New gutters and downspouts should be as unobtrusive as possible and should be painted a color that is compatible with the building.</i></p>	<p>Box gutters and round downspouts will be installed on the new roof to ensure proper drainage and diversion of water. Staff finds that this design of gutter and downspout is appropriate for the building and district. <u>Staff recommends that final gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u></p>

# Figures

Figure 1. Front façade of 3307 East Marshall Street. Google Street view, July 2023, accessed October 17, 2023



Figure 2. Rear of 3305-3307 East Marshall Street, CAR Files, 2015. Original porches had been removed, however ghosting of original porches and the neighboring porches at 3309-3311 East Marshall Street were used as a reference.



Figure 3. 1952 Sanborn Map showing identical two-story rear porches with roofs at 3305-3311 East Marshall Street. Original porches on all four units appear to have been removed, however 3309-3311 have been reconstructed to have a similar footprint and location as the original. 3305-3307 East Marshall Street's rear porches have been reconstructed to match the neighboring property, but do not include a roof covering.

