

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
September 23, 2014 Meeting**

7. **CAR No. 14-098** (St. John's Church) **2401 East Broad Street**
St. John's Church Old and Historic District

Project Description: **Rehabilitate roof of church and parish hall**

Staff Contact: **J. Hill**

The applicant seeks approval to remove the existing Hendricks Tile from the roof of the church and the existing painted standing-seam metal roof of the parish hall at this property in the eponymous St. John's Church Old and Historic District and to install new standing-seam copper roofs on both buildings. The church roof was covered with wood shingles from 1741 until 1898, when the shingles were replaced with a standing-seam metal roof. The church stood in its current form with a standing-seam metal roof from 1905 until 1963 when the Hendricks Tile roof was installed. The increased weight of the tiles required the introduction of a steel structural system to support the roof. Historic Structure Reports prepared for the church in 2005 and 2007 note the damage to the building created by the heavy tiles and recommend their removal and replacement with a lighter historically appropriate material. The installation of a new standing-seam terne-coated copper roof will return the roof to the appearance it had from 1905 to 1963, taking into account the period of time during which the new copper roof will oxidize and acquire the patina that protects the metal. A sample of the copper roofing material will be available at the meeting.

The replacement of the parish hall roof will involve removing standing-seam metal painted to look like patinated copper and the installation of standing-seam copper.

Staff recommend approval of the project. The weight of the Hendricks Tile on a structure not designed to carry them renders unsustainable their replacement in kind. The only other roof material the church building has had, since the construction of its most recent additions in 1905, is standing-seam metal. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (pages 4-5 in the *Guidelines*) note that the replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence. The applicant has provided both documentary and pictorial evidence for the church building, in its current form, having a standing-seam metal roof. The work proposed at the parish hall constitutes an in-kind replacement, with the new material matching the old in design, color (in time), texture, and other visual qualities.

It is the assessment of staff that the project is consistent with the Standards for rehabilitation in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code and with the additional rehabilitation standards and guidelines for the use of substitute materials in the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, adopted by the Commission for review of certificates of appropriateness under the same section of the code.