



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

2. COA-109601-2022	Final Review	Meeting Date: 4/26/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Taylor Bergman	
Project Description	Rebuild a rear deck and fence, and construct a pergola.	
Project Location		
Address: 3108 E. Broad St.		
Historic District: St. John's Church		
High-Level Details: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant proposes to remove an existing rear deck, shed, and privacy fence. The applicant proposes to construct a new rear deck, privacy fence, pergola, and carport. The majority of the materials selected for new construction consist of vinyl, PVC, and composite decking. 		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alyson Oliver, alyson.oliver@RVA.gov , 804-646-3709	
Previous Reviews	None	
Conditions for Approval	<p>Staff approval of this request, with the following conditions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The pergola be constructed of wood and painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main building. Final colors submitted to staff for review and approval. The carport columns be wrapped in wood and painted or stained a neutral color to complement the main building. If the existing rear privacy fence is removed, it be reconstructed of wood and painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main building. Any new rear fencing must incorporate a traditional privacy fence design with vertically-oriented pickets. Final design and colors to be submitted to staff for review and approval. 	

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
<p>New Construction, Decks, pg. 51 #1-5</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>Decks should not alter, damage or destroy significant site elements of the property.</i> 2. <i>Decks should complement the architectural features of the main structure without creating a false historical appearance. Decks should be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure.</i> 3. <i>Deck design may include vertical picket balustrades or contemporary railing that is in scale with the house and the deck.</i> 4. <i>Deck sub-decking should be screened with wood lattice work or with brick piers.</i> 5. <i>As is the case with all other auxiliary structures, decks cannot be constructed in front yards (in accordance with the Zoning Ordinance).</i> 	<p>The property owner is requesting to upgrade the rear outdoor living space through removal and replacement/enlargement of the existing rear deck</p> <p>The new deck will be constructed using composite decking and will sit on-grade. Due to the presence of a rear yard privacy fence, the proposed deck will not be visible from the public right-of-way, and is therefore not covered in this analysis.</p>
<p>New Construction, Residential Outbuildings, pg. 51 #1-4</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos, and other auxiliary structures, should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and material selection.</i> 2. <i>Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i> 3. <i>New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary structures.</i> 4. <i>Prefabricated yard structures are discouraged. Screening will be considered as a mitigating factor for the installation of these structures. However, prefabricated structures will still be reviewed for compatibility using the criteria developed in this section.</i> 	<p>The applicant is proposing to install two outbuildings: a pergola and a carport.</p> <p>First, the applicant plans to install a 24' by 16' pergola around the new deck, which is anticipated to extend above the rear privacy fence and be visible from the alley. The proposed pergola is generally compatible with the guidelines for residential outbuildings. However, the applicant is proposing the pergola to be constructed of white vinyl. Synthetic materials, such as vinyl, and prefabricated structures are generally discouraged in City Old and Historic Districts as they are not visually compatible with original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood. <u>Staff recommends the pergola be constructed of wood and painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main building. Final colors submitted to staff for review and approval.</u></p> <p>The applicant is also proposing to install a carport to the rear of the fence along the alley. The proposed carport is generally compatible with the guidelines for residential outbuildings and uses materials that are compatible with the existing dwelling. However, staff notes that the plans indicate that the steel columns will be wrapped in PVC to form 8" by 8" columns. The guidelines note that:</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><i>“Painted PVC decorative features are an option that also have limited</i></p>

		<p><i>application for use on historic properties. Painted PVC decorative features (balusters, balustrades, columns, column capitals, cornice brackets, etc.) may be used as a substitute material for deteriorated wood and metal features.” (pg. 60)</i></p> <p>To comply with the guidelines, <u>staff recommends that the carport columns be wrapped in wood and painted or stained a neutral color to complement the main building.</u></p>
Paint, Historic Masonry, pg. 63, #1	<i>Do not paint historic brick or stone that has not previously been painted. Painting previously unpainted masonry is historically inaccurate and is not permitted. Property owners who wish to remove paint from masonry should work with a qualified contractor knowledgeable in the use of non-abrasive cleaners.</i>	The applicant is proposing to remove a rear shed that is current flush with the rear façade of the building. After removal, the applicant proposes to paint the previously covered brick to match the rest of the building. While painting unpainted masonry is generally discouraged, the existing dwelling has already been painted and is a color that is listed as appropriate on the commission-approved paint palette. Therefore, staff approves the proposal to paint or repaint the portion of the building that is currently obscured by the existing shed to match the rest of the dwelling.
New Construction, Fences & Walls, pg. 51 #3	<i>Privacy fences along the side and rear of a property should be constructed of wood of an appropriate design. Privacy fences are not appropriate in front of a historic building.</i>	The applicant is also proposing to remove the existing wooden rear privacy fence and replace it with a new composite privacy fence. The guidelines specify the rear privacy fences in City Old and Historic Districts should be constructed of wood. Therefore, <u>staff recommends that if the existing rear privacy fence is removed, it be reconstructed of wood and painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main building.</u>
Fences Walls, pg. 78 #9	<i>Rear-yard privacy fences should mimic traditional fence designs.</i>	Specifications on the design of the rear privacy fence have not been provided. <u>Staff recommends that the rear privacy fence incorporate a traditional privacy fence design with vertically-oriented pickets. Final design to be submitted to staff for review and approval.</u>
Fences & Walls, pg. 78 #10	<i>Wooden fences should be repaired and painted as needed. Existing picket designs should be matched when replacement is necessary.</i>	The applicant is proposing to remove and replace the existing rear privacy fence. Staff encourages the applicant to consider repairing the existing fence, rather than complete replacement.

Figures



Figure 1. Façade photo ca. 198



Figure 2. View of exiting deck and shed.



Figure 3. View of existing rear yard privacy fence, looking toward alley.