



Meeting Minutes - Final
Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, May 23, 2017

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

BEGINNING AT 3:30 P.M.

BEGINNING AT 3:30 P.M.

Call to Order

Mr. Yates called the meeting to order at 3:30 pm

Roll Call

Present -- 9 - * David C. Cooley, * Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, * Sanford Bond, * Bryan Green, * Nathan Hughes, * James W. Klaus, * Andrew Ray McRoberts, * Joseph Yates and * Gerald Jason Hendricks

Approval of Minutes

February 28, 2017

Mr. Cooley stated that in regards to the February 28th minutes it stated that Mr. Bond was excused or recused and stated that he thinks it was an error. Mr. Cooley stated that it was mentioned that the Commission discussed the policy pertaining to the Commission members talking to applicants prior to the meeting and inquired if that was a policy somewhere now. Mr. Green stated that the content of it was that if a Commission member does speak to an applicant prior to a meeting that they should come forward with that at the beginning of the discussion. Mr. Cooley stated that under the Administrative approval in the second paragraph he is quoted but stated that he wants to make sure he was quoted correctly and stated that he doesn't think the sentence was correct. Mr. Cooley stated that brand AZEK is similar to brand Trex and that both are PVC products with a grain texture and stated that there was a fake wood product called Tendura that is no longer on the market.

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Commissioner Cooley, that this be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

April 25, 2017

Mr. Cooley stated that on the second page of the minutes pertaining to the house with graffiti it stated that if they didn't do anything by May 1st that they would get a summons and inquired where that project stands. Ms. Pitts answered that they are working with the property owner and stated that they have power washed the structure but unfortunately it didn't help removing the paint. Ms. Pitts stated that he has picked a paint color to paint it and stated that the work was supposed to start yesterday but due to the rain it has been delayed to start on June 1st.

Mr. Green inquired if the owner has put the cementitious siding on yet and Ms. Pitts stated that the owner has decided to paint the existing siding instead.

Mr. Cooley stated that the minutes state that Ms. Pitts gave an update on the property where the owner has painted his foundation blue and stated that Ms. Pitts reported that the brick had been stripped which he thought was remarkable. Mr. Cooley stated that he drove past there and it has been repainted red and Ms. Pitts stated that she doesn't think that is the house they are speaking of. Mr. Cooley made a motion to approve the April 25th minutes, second Mr. Yates, all passed, Hughes abstained. Mr. Cooley thanked staff for sending the minutes along with the packets.

A motion was made by Commissioner Cooley, seconded by Yates, that this be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

Abstain -- 1 - Nathan Hughes

National Register Nominations

[NR 2017-3](#) Robert Fulton Elementary School

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Registration Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Jeffries gave an overview of the national register nomination for Robert Fulton Elementary School and stated that it is being nominated under national register criteria A and C at the local level with a period of significance of 1917 to 1930. Ms. Jeffries stated that the building was designed in the Colonial Revival style and stated that staff recommends that the Commission approve the nomination of the building under National Register for criteria A and C at the local level.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that she was curious about the timing of this because it has been owned by the same owner for a long time. Ms. Jeffries stated that staff noticed this as well but did not know the reason for the timing.

Mr. Cooley inquired what has been done to the property.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if they could be eligible twice for tax credits. Ms. Chen stated that being that it wasn't listed it wouldn't have been eligible for tax credits for any previous rehabilitation but they may be seeking tax credits for a second round of rehabilitation and stated that they would be subjected to the standards.

Mr. Cooley stated that it does fit the criteria and stated that it has some history to it.

Mr. Bond made a motion to support the nomination. The motion was seconded by Mr. McRoberts and passed.

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that this Report be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

[NR 2017-4](#) North Thompson Street Historic District

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Registration Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Jeffries gave an overview of the national register nomination for N. Thompson Street Historic District and stated that the application of the National Register criteria indicates that the district is eligible for listing under National Register Criterion C for its architecture at the local level with a period of significance of 1955-1959. Ms. Jeffries stated that the North Thompson Street Historic District is a cohesive collection of five International Style buildings that convey defining characteristics such as lack of ornamentation, smooth textures, flat roofs, ribbons of windows or glass curtain walls, and asymmetrical elevations. Staff recommends that the Commission support the nomination of the district under National Register Criterion C at the local level. Ms. Jeffries stated that staff does have concerns with the auto-centric character of this corridor and its proximity to the new Pulse Rapid Transit line.

The Commission, however, took no formal action on the North Thompson Street Historic district nomination. There was extensive conversation about the need and desire to list and recognize buildings associated with our recent history and an acknowledgement that buildings of more recent vintage are often threatened with demolition. The Commission accepted that this is a unique collection of mid-twentieth century buildings. The Commission however raised concerns about the integrity of some of the buildings included in the nomination. The International Style by its very nature is spare and the loss of a single character defining feature can greatly impact architectural integrity. For example the major window and entrance alterations at 1000 N. Thompson Street and the loss of the full façade canopy and glazing on the Central National Bank, 3501 West Broad Street. The Commission questioned if these were the best examples of the International Style in the City.

Continuation of discussion

Mr. Yates stated that if this corridor is going to be a historic district then why not include the 3600 Building because that and the bank were built as complimentary structures of the same brick, designed by the same architect, and it's a major building in that part of town. Mr. Yates stated that he doesn't understand why the old Seaboard Building isn't a part of the nomination.

Mr. Klaus made a motion to accept the recommendation for these buildings to the National Register Nomination, the motion was seconded by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor.

Mr. Cooley stated that midcentury modern is something that came across his radar recently, largely because he was born in the era, and stated that he thought it was very interesting that this architecture is considered old and significant. Mr. Cooley stated that to hear these gentlemen point out that a lot of the character of those buildings has been lost so if the state can't mandate that they be returned to original condition as part of the process to get tax credits causes him to pause.

Mr. Yates stated that when he came to Richmond those buildings were intact and stated that it was an interesting display of mid-20th century design and added that is his major concern right now that they have a row of deteriorated buildings and even putting them on the register is not going to guarantee that they are going to be restored. Mr. Yates commented that they are going to end up with this hodge podge of half 1950 architecture and half ill thought out renovations and yet they have an historic district in the middle of the city.

Mr. Klaus stated that out of the 6 buildings chances are if they don't do anything they are not going to be able to save anything.

Mr. Green stated that the question is are these buildings significant enough to tell the story presented in the nomination.

Mr. Klaus stated that when he looked at those buildings he felt that there was something interesting about those buildings.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that with International style it has such lack of fenestration and has such clean lines that she wondered what they would do to make it worse.

Mr. Green commented that the register decision can't take into consideration for future acts and stated that what it is existing now is what is under review.

Mr. Cooley stated that if they do not support the establishment of a district they further guarantee the buildings' deterioration.

Mr. Green clarified that all the Commission is doing is making a recommendation on the nomination, not blocking the historic district and added that DHR is asking the opinion from this body.

Ms. Chen stated that one of the criteria for the listing is whether or not they still possess enough integrity to speak to what they are and stated that she doesn't believe in their role as the CLG that they have to take a definitive yes we support or no we don't support because what generally occurs after the meeting is that they correspond with James Hare who is the state's National Register Coordinator and added that they can always take a more middle of the road stance. She added that it is an interesting collection of buildings but there is some doubt as to whether or not they still possess enough integrity. Ms. Chen stated that if the Commission chooses they could not vote it up or down and just make a statement including what has been discussed.

Mr. Klaus retracted his motion to read that the Commission not take action today but states that the Commission thinks there are definitely some interesting buildings within this corridor that they think should be a part of the district but states that based on what they have been presented with they will need more information to know which ones have lost integrity. The motion was seconded by Mr. Yates and passed 8-0-0.

**A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Yates, that this Report be received.
The motion carried by the following vote:**

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

Other Business

Mr. Klaus stated that there was a front-page article about the historic district and stated that there were a lot of comments and misleading information about CAR and what they were and weren't doing and stated that they did not interview anyone from the Commission.

Mr. Yates stated that he received an email from a reporter and he had asked staff if they would handle it because there was no winning in that article. Mr. Yates stated that he was annoyed and felt that the coverage was rather innocuous. Mr. Klaus inquired if they could write a response to explain what the Commission Guidelines are for new construction and explain what the Commission does. Mr. Klaus stated that there was a lot of misinformation there and the Commission needs to educate them on what we do.

Ms. Pitts stated that Mr. Yates informed her by email and she forwarded it to the

Planning Director and he is supposed to get it touch with the reporter.

Mr. Green stated that it is over and done with and if they write a letter they will just bring it back up again. Mr. Green stated that if you go to any public meeting where this kind of stuff comes up about 10 percent of the people that are going to get up and speak are going to be misinformed and stated that they are not going to change their mind and stated that they are talking about feelings and not facts.

Mr. Klaus stated that he will take it up himself and write a letter and the Commission members can read it and decide whether it will it help or hurt the situation.

Mr. Green stated that is why they are going to different neighborhoods and talk to them face to face because they get better traction that way instead of going back and forth with the newspaper.

Ms. Pitts stated that they mailed out cards to all of the residences in the old and historic districts letting them know that they were in the district and what it meant.

Mr. Yates stated that if Mr. Klaus drafted a letter the Commission will be happy to review it.

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts stated that Commission received an email from Alexander Rawls for FOIA training and it stated that the Chair or Vice Chair and any new members should attend the training. She added that she spoke to the Planning Director and he stated that Permits and Inspections has a gentleman name Isaac Marks who is our FOIA representative for our department. Ms. Pitts stated that Mr. McRobers informed her that they should have a FOIA representative for the Commission and stated that she was hoping the Commission would appoint Mr. Marks.

Mr. Yates made a motion that Isaac Marks be the Commission's FOIA representative. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hendricks and passed 8-0-0.

Ms. Pitts stated that according to the rules and procedures they need to elect and Chair and Vice Chair at the June meeting. Ms. Pitts stated that the Chair and Vice Chair are given the opportunity to stay on for 2 years.

Mr. Green stated that both of the chairs' terms expire next year.

Ms. Pitts stated that in regards to the discussion for appointments in terms of the Better Housing Coalition appointment to the Commission, Councilperson Robertson was going to put in a paper to have it chaged. Ms. Pitts stated that she and Mr. Olinger met with her and stated that they chose Better Housing Coalition because they were ACORN and not affordable housing. Ms. Pitts stated that Ms. Robertson is introducing legislation to change that appointment to someone that lives in an old and historic district.

Ms. Chen stated that the Coke sign at 1st and Broad Street is going to be removed, restored, re-illuminated and reinstalled. Ms. Chen stated that Coca Cola has taken an interest in their historic signage and is doing this nationally.

Administrative Approvals

Were distributed.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Pitts stated that people have been following up with their enforcements.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that at 29th Street across from Chimborazo School attic vents were done without approval.

Mr. Yates stated that at 2223 W. Grace Street they have installed a retaining wall and stated that it looks okay but he doesn't remember an approval for it.

Ms. Pitts stated that several Commissioners have inquired about the rehab at 2220 Jefferson Avenue because the incorrect windows have been installed and added that according to the contractor they ordered the wrong windows and they are waiting for the new ones to come.

Mr. Green mentioned the last quarterly meeting when they talked about archeology guidelines and stated that he contacted the staff in Alexandria and was told that it is done through city code and stated that they have guidelines which they can't find and haven't been updated since 1992. Mr. Green stated that he doesn't know how much of a model it is going to be and added that they haven't sent him the guidelines yet. Mr. Green stated that it is a city mandated review that is a part of any building permit or ground disturbance and stated that is the only one in the country that he knows of that is integrated in the review process. Mr. Green stated that he emailed a resolution for Mr. Louis Malon who is retiring from Preservation of Virginia and asked everyone to stop by and sign it.

Other Committee Reports

Please Note

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

BEGINNING AT 4:00 P.M.

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that the consent agenda be approved with conditions. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 1 [COA-016792-2017](#) 214 North 26th Street - Replace existing rear deck with a new deck.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[COA-016792 214 North 26th St](#)

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: details of the proposed railing be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and the structure be painted or stained a color to be administratively approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 2 [COA-017153-2017](#) 7 East Broad Street - Rehabilitate a commercial structure.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the work is performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be provided to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 3 [COA-016775-2017](#) 3416 East Marshall - Install wood handrail.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the posts be modified by removing the portion above the V groove; and the railing be painted or opaquely stained a color to be administratively reviewed and approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 8 [COA-016776-2017](#) 2602 East Franklin Street - Construct a new shed.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 15 [COA-017154-2017](#) 616 North 25th Street - Rehabilitate front and rear porchs of a residential structure and construct a new rear deck.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the front porch columns match the dimensions of the surviving half round columns; and the rear decks be painted or stained a color to be administratively approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

REGULAR AGENDA

Present -- 8 - * David C. Cooley, * Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, * Sanford Bond, * Bryan Green, * Nathan Hughes, * James W. Klaus, * Andrew Ray McRoberts and * Joseph Yates

- 4 [COA-016764-2017](#) 18 West Leigh Street - Construct a new rear two story porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission had concerns with the dimensions, accurate drawings, and the rise and run of the stairs and if they would require a zoning variance.

Mr. Bond stated that they should defer the application so that the applicant can check the building code with the building officials so they know what the rise and run is of the stairs and then redraw it so that it reflects what the applicant wants to do.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that her personal concern is that she doesn't know what she is approving because she doesn't have a drawing that accurately reflects it and stated that it is important for staff to have an accurate drawing so that they can compare the drawing to what was actually built.

Mr. Yates stated that his concern is that a switchback stair is certainly more historically correct than one that is projecting out into the backyard and stated that the 2 story deck and stair are going to completely obliterate the end of the house. Mr. Yates stated that it is not a traditional porch arrangement that he is familiar with in the city.

Mr. Green stated that you wouldn't have seen this design originally and stated that if those stairs were there when the district was created they would be grandfathered in.

Mr. Bond made a motion to defer the application until the applicant can provide accurate drawings that reflect what is really going to be built and that the drawings reflect the rise and run of the stairs. Mr. McRoberts seconded the motion and stated that he will add that if there is precedence for this style of stair case in the neighborhood

that the applicant needs to bring it in so the Commission can review it.

Mr. Cooley stated that there is one dimension for the width of the existing porch of 6ft and stated that they talk about a switch back stairs and that each stair, according to code, if it is added should be 3 feet. Mr. Green stated that they are adding 8ft on the back. Mr. Cooley inquired if they were suggesting that if the switchback stair case occur within the footprint of the existing porch and Mr. Green stated no and stated that it is within the back. 8-1-0 Hendricks opposed.

A motion was made by Bond, seconded by McRoberts that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant time to submit revised drawings that reflect the proposed location of the stairs and dimensions for the stairs that meet building code

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

No -- 1 - Gerald Jason Hendricks

5 [COA-016766-2017](#) 9 North 29th Street - Replace concrete walkway and steps with brick.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the concrete steps and curbing be retained. The motion carried the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus and Andrew Ray McRoberts

No -- 3 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks and Joseph Yates

Recused -- 1 - David C. Cooley

6 [COA-016768-2017](#) 520 West Marshall Street - Replace five windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The Commission inquired what the 2010 decision was and what documentation had been sent to the applicant.

Ms. Pitts stated that the staff report was clear and the minutes were clear that the Commission approved the application per the staff report.

Mr. Klaus inquired if they could defer all the 2010 windows and discuss the windows at the front and defer the rest until they can research more information from the 2010 meeting.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that she doesn't want to make any hasty conclusions

regarding the 2010 decision because there is lack of clarity and thinks that the Commission needs some direction.

Mr. Cooley stated that he called one of his suppliers and stated that replacement windows with an ogee lug is a newer phenomenon but it is out there and stated that Marvin makes one and inquired if that is what staff is recommending. Mr. Green answered that staff was recommending the ogee lugs be added to the existing windows, which was confirmed by staff.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that the 2010 application was for windows 6 through 12. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made a motion to approve windows 1 through 5 with staff recommendations and windows 6 through 12 be deferred for further investigation into what the applicant was sent in the 2010 Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Mr. Klaus and passed 9-0-0.

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Klaus that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission approved the replacement of the windows on the façade (Windows 1-5) with the following condition: ogee lugs to match the previous windows be added to Windows 1-3 (second story windows). The Commission deferred the alterations to the side and rear windows to allow for additional time to gather materials from the 2010 approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 7 [COA-016770-2017](#) 501 North 25th Street - Install fiber cement sidings on all sides of the existing structure.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Bond that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: fiber cement siding be installed on the north and rear elevations and be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal; and a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged from all elevations and installed with the historic reveals on the two primary elevations, or wood siding be replaced in-kind on the primary elevations. The motion carried the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 11 [COA-016783-2017](#) 821 North 24th Street - Construct a new duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Klaus that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the simulated divided lite windows include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar between the glass; and the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded. The motion carried the following vote:

- Aye --** 8 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates
- No --** 1 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

12 [COA-016788-2017](#) 2310 Venable Street - Construct a new duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Hughes that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the simulated divided lite windows include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar between the glass; the HVAC units be located on the side and screened from the public view; the parking area be gravel; and the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded. The motion carried the following vote:

- Aye --** 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

13 [COA-0161789-2017](#) 966-968 Pink Street - Construct a new duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Cooley that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the simulated divided lite windows include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; the steps from the street be constructed of brick; the front walkway material be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded. The motion carried the following vote:

- Aye --** 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

14 [COA-016790-2017](#) 2805 East Clay Street - Install Fiber Cement siding and replace windows on the facade.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn

- 16 [COA-017182-2017](#) 412 North 26th Street - Replace siding and windows, repair porch, construct new garage, and construct a side addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the condition of the wood siding be assessed in coordination with CAR staff and if possible, a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged and installed with the historic reveals the façade, if enough siding cannot be salvaged for the façade new wood siding with a reveal to match the historic reveal be installed on the façade; fiber cement siding be installed on the secondary elevations with the condition that the siding be installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal, be smooth, and be unbeaded; the 2nd floor windows on the façade be retained; a detailed window survey illustrating the condition of each window be provided for staff to administratively review and approve any window replacement; a dimensioned façade elevation to include the new openings be provided for administrative review and approval; any new windows in the existing structure and the addition be true or simulated divided lite windows to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; the proposed columns match the surviving half columns and brackets; the railing be painted or opaquely stained a color to be reviewed and approved by staff; details of the proposed wainscoting be provided to staff for administrative review and approval; and paint colors be provided for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 17 [COA-016996-2017](#) 713 North 24th Street - Construct a new attached single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that her biggest concern was how they were going to tear one unit down and keep the other.

Mr. Cooley stated that they can take a chain saw up on the roof and come in a few

inches from the property line.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that she likes the bump-out but states that the roofline is a bigger issue for the addition and added that it is a weird detail the way it is drawn. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that it will help them out a lot when they come back to have images of how it relates to the other house. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that a photo montage might be better than the drawings.

Mr. Klaus stated that they should keep the windows consistent with 6/6 windows of the adjacent house.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that it might be easier to keep the front façade.

Mr. Cooley stated that the only thing is old on that front is the siding and the studs behind it and stated that the trim around the upstairs windows aren't even old.

Mr. Yates stated that the porch details, the columns and dentils and handrail are original and stated that it will be nice to save them. Mr. Yates stated that he agrees with staff that the one foot addition bump-out is odd.

Mr. Klaus stated that the window sizes are different and they are not original.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that it is odd for the head heights to be that high from the ceiling.

Mr. Cooley suggested that the applicant save the dentils and columns.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 18 [COA-016998-2017](#) 2313 Carrington Street - Rehabilitate two single family homes and construct a rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Green stated that if the applicant finds out that the brackets were messed with it would be nice to see them get back into the regular pattern that relates to the windows.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that some more clear drawings will help them to see the existing footprint verses the new footprint so the Commission can understand what is changing.

Mr. Yates stated that when the applicant gets to the demolition phase to let staff know so those who are interested can see what is going on under the siding and plywood.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 10 [COA-016782-2017](#) 717 North 24th Street - Rehabilitate attached single family home and construct a new rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Hughes, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the front window opening on the side elevation be retained; the fiber cement siding be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal to match the historic reveal; the windows be wood or aluminum clad wood windows with true or simulated divided lites to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; specifications of the proposed windows be provided to staff for administrative review and approval; railing details be provided to staff for administrative review and approval; and the deck be painted or stained a neutral color, to be reviewed and approved by staff, that complements one or more of the colors found in the main structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus and Joseph Yates

Excused -- 1 - Andrew Ray McRoberts

9 [COA-016781-2017](#) 2243 West Grace Street - Replace attic vent with window.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Yates, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted provided that the following condition is met: details of the proposed glazing be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus and Joseph Yates

Excused -- 1 - Andrew Ray McRoberts

Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 7:13 pm.