


Commission of Architectural Review

1. COA-141043-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 1/23/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Sam Tuttle, Streetcar Properties	
Project Description	Construct rear garage with accessory dwelling unit above.	
Project Location		
Address: 972-974 Pink Street		
Historic District: Union Hill		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The applicant plans to construct a garage behind the historic house, with a finished living space on the second floor. • The garage will be located to the northeast of the existing dwelling and set back from the street. • This new building will be visible from Pink Street, Carrington Street, and the Public Alley behind the lot. 		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Annie Delaroderie, anne.delaroderie@rva.gov , 804-646-6335.	
Previous Reviews	<p>Plans for this project were presented for Conceptual Review at the Commission’s December 2023 meeting. The Commissioners supported the plans for the project. One commissioner thought the applicant could consider another material for the railings. The applicant added additional details to his application in response to the staff recommendations.</p> <p>In June and July 2023, the Commission reviewed plans for a new attached house, that was to be connected to 970-972 Pink Street. At the June meeting, the Commission supported the proposed design and believed it was compatible with the subject block and the district and met the Old and Historic District Guidelines. Commissioners discussed the treatment of the front yard and the use of railings on the front porch. At July 2023 Commission meeting, commissioners approved the project with conditions regarding front porch roofing, placement of electrical meters, and window patterns. The applicant did not go through with these approved plans.</p> <p>In September 2016, the Commission reviewed and approved plans for the rehabilitation of 970-972 Pink Street. The dwellings were in poor condition and very little original material was in-tact. The rehabilitation included new windows, new window openings, new roofing, new fiber cement cladding, the reconstruction of the front porch and rear additions.</p> <p>974 Pink Street is currently a vacant lot. In 2001, Code Enforcement required the demolition of the building previously attached to 970-972 Pink Street.</p>	

Staff Recommendations	<p>Staff recommends:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • that the decking on the garage have a finished appearance with no exposed hardware, as it will be visible from Pink Street. • final color selections be submitted for Administrative Review and Approval. • that the building be constructed true to the plan so that it is lower than the primary building.
-----------------------	---

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
New Construction: Residential Outbuildings, page 51.	<i>1. Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos, and other auxiliary structures should be compatible with the design of the primary building on site, including roof slope and materials selection.</i>	<p>The proposed garage will have side-gabled, asphalt shingle roof, similar to the primary building. The primary building has fiber cement siding, and the proposed garage will have the same siding material.</p> <p>The exterior staircase leading to the second floor of the garage will have wood decking with a Richmond Rail design. <u>Staff recommends that the decking on the garage have a finished appearance with no exposed hardware, as it will be visible from Pink Street.</u></p> <p>There will be a canopy above the second-floor balcony, that will have a TPO roof.</p> <p>The CMU foundation will be parged, which was recommended from the Conceptual Staff Report.</p> <p>Garage doors will be wooden and a simple, paneled design.</p>
New Construction: Residential Outbuildings, page 51.	<i>2. Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages, or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i>	<p>It is preferred for secondary buildings to be setback from the primary building. Due to the openness of the rear yards on this block, the new garage will also be visible from Carrington Street. The new building will be compatible with the primary building. This block and the surrounding blocks do not have rear residential outbuildings. <u>Staff recommends final color selections be submitted for Administrative Review and Approval.</u></p>
New Construction: Residential Outbuildings, page 51.	<i>3. New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary structures.</i>	<p>The applicant confirmed with staff that the proposed garage building will be smaller than the primary dwelling. He explained that the house is 19'6" at the sidewalk. The new garage will be 20'7", but is at the back of the sloping lot, making it 3' lower than the base floor elevation of the primary house. Due to the slope of the lot, the applicant said the new garage will be 23" shorter than the primary dwelling.</p> <p>Since the garage will only be lower than the primary building due to the grade of the site, <u>Staff recommends that the building be constructed true to the plan so that it is lower than the primary building.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1. View of 970-972 Pink Street facades.



Figure 2. 1925 Sanborn Map with 972 Pink Street highlighted in red.



Figure 3. View to the north of 972 Pink Street, and approximate view of the new garage.



Figure 4. Rear view of 970-972 Pink Street, from the public alley.



Figure 5. Rear view of 972 Pink Street, from the public alley.



Figure 6. View from Carrington Street, looking up the public alley to 972 Pink Street. 972 Pink Street is the second dwelling on the left of the photograph.