

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
November 22, 2016, Meeting**

9. **CAR No. 17-020** (Habitat for Humanity) **902 North 25th Street
Union Hill Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Construct a new two story addition in rear,
one story entry porch, and add fiber cement siding.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate a residential structure in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. This Antebellum home has been altered over time to include a stucco cladding, the removal of the two story side porches, and the removal of the full façade front porch. The structure has a standing seam metal gable roof and a bracketed cornice. The applicant is proposing the following work on the structure:

- **Siding:** Remove the stucco cladding and install fiber cement siding with a 6" reveal on all elevations.
- **Roof:** Remove the standing seam metal roof and install a combination of asphalt and synthetic slate shingles.
- **Front Porch:** Construct a front porch. The proposed roof will be a low sloped hipped roof clad in grey membrane. The applicant proposes 6" box columns and Richmond rail.
- **Existing Doors and Windows:** Install 6/6 wood simulated divided lite windows in the existing openings and install 6 panel wooden doors in the existing door openings. Restore the glazing in the side lites and transom above the front door.
- **Addition:** Construct an addition in the location of a former two story side porch. The proposed addition will have a membrane, shed roof. The addition will be clad in combination of lap siding and board and batten siding. The applicant is proposing to install 6" box columns and the board and batten siding to give the appearance of the railing of the historic porches. The addition will include six 6/6 windows with shutters.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with conditions.

Siding: The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that fiber cement siding is a product with limited applications which includes being used on secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right of way (pg. 56). Staff observed wood siding beneath the stucco on the façade though was unable to assess the condition of this material. Staff recommends the condition of the wood siding under the stucco be assessed in

coordination with CAR staff and if possible, a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged and installed with the historic reveals on façade. Staff supports the installation of fiber cement siding on the secondary elevations with the condition that the siding be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal. Staff recommends the proposed siding color be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.

Roof: The *Guidelines* state that original roof materials should be retained (pg. 55, #4). Additionally, though the Guidelines note that substitute roof materials may be used in certain cases, they state that the substitute material should match the original style and form as much as possible (pg. 62, #3). Staff recommends the existing metal roof be retained or replaced in kind as the proposed shingles do not effectively convey the appearance of a standing seam metal roof which is a visible, character defining feature of this structure.

Front Porch: The *Guidelines* note that replacement porches should match the original as much as possible (pg. 67, #5). The proposed porch roof shape is based on the ghosting on the structure and the proposed porch roof material effectively conveys the appearance of traditional flat metal porch roofs. As the only image of the porch staff has located is from the 1993 Historic District survey which indicates the porch present with its turned balusters and sawn brackets was a later addition, staff does not know the original porch design. Staff supports the simple square posts and Richmond rail as they are compatible with the District.

Existing Windows and Doors: The *Guidelines* state that all original windows should be retained and repaired and should only be replaced when the windows have deteriorated beyond the point of repair (pg. 65, #1, 6, 7). Staff does not know if there are any existing windows or doors remaining on the interior of the structure. Staff recommends the applicant work with staff to determine if it is possible to retain and repair any sash that could be concentrated on the façade of the dwelling. Staff finds the proposed window and door materials and configuration are appropriate for the structure as the 1993 photograph shows the 6/6 windows on the façade.

Addition: The Guidelines note that addition should be subordinate to the size of the main structure and as inconspicuous as possible (pg. 44, Siting #1). Staff finds the proposed addition is small and located on a secondary elevation. The proposed addition acknowledges that it is located where historically a two story open porch stood as seen on the 1905 Sanborn Map. The *Guidelines* state for porch enclosures, glass enclosures which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred as solid materials radically alter the historic appearance of a porch (pg. 67, #13). Staff supports the applicant's attempt to include glazing, board and batten siding, and columns to convey the appearance of a porch. Staff recommends the siding area surrounding the windows and shutters be minimized by increasing the window size or number or altering the layout of the windows and shutters in a manner to be reviewed and approved by CAR staff. Additionally, staff recommends the shutters be of proper dimension to cover the window.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Sections 30-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.