

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, November 26, 2024

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2024.063](#)

Public Access and Participation Instruction - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner John Grier, * Commissioner Mitch Danese, * Commissioner Larry Nutt, * Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, * Commissioner Emily Striffler and * Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner Erik Bootsma

OTHER BUSINESS

Approval of Minutes

None

Secretary's Report

Revised Bylaws

No Action

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Easterling, to move item #4 to the Consent Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: (8) DANESE, EASTERLING, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, NUTT, RODRIGUEZ (Left early), STRIFFLER
No: (0)
Excused: (1) BOOTSMA
Recused: (0)

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to move item #2 to the Consent Agenda.

Yes: (8) DANESE, EASTERLING, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, NUTT, RODRIGUEZ (Left early), STRIFFLER
No: (0)
Excused: (1) BOOTSMA
Recused: (0)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Andrew Moore

1. [COA-156645-2024](#) 714 North 30th Street - Paint a mural on a water tower.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the installation must not permanently damage or alter the water tank; the mural must avoid the use of dayglow, luminescent, or reflective paints or materials; and all proposed work must comply with existing zoning requirements.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Andrew Moore

2. [COA-157142-2024](#) 2003 West Grace Street - Construct a new rear Accessory Dwelling Unit.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Any additional items required by zoning that do not radically alter the proposed design be submitted for administrative review and approval; and any associated exhaust vents or fans for the new equipment be installed in a way that minimizes visual impact from the public right-of-way.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Andrew Moore

4. [COA-156672-2024](#) 13 West Franklin Street - Demolish a non-original valet parking booth.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Hill to approve this application with conditions for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: Staff recommends approval of the proposed demolition for the following reasons: Staff finds that the valet parking building does not contribute to the historic character of the West Franklin Street Old and Historic District. Based information provided by the applicant and the CAR files, the building is not original to the site and is not "historic". Demolition of the building will not have a negative and irreversible impact to the streetscape or district.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Andrew Moore

REGULAR AGENDA

3. [COA-156665-2024](#) 2209 East Broad Street - Remove two windows and a two doors on the first story and install a wide glass door.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Grier, seconded by Commissioner Hill to defer this application to allow the applicant additional time to address recommendations. Specific recommendations included resubmitting an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness that included existing condition images of the rear, west elevation. The Commission also asked that detailed elevation drawings that show existing architectural features that will be retained, such as the stone lintels above the existing doors. The Commission believed that the work will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way, but wanted more detail on how the historic fabric of the building will be impacted and what features could be retained to reference the original fenestration pattern once the new door is installed.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

5. [COA-156644-2024](#) 323 North 36th Street - Enclose a rear, second-story porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application with conditions for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: the applicant collaborates with staff to incorporate a horizontal element around the entirety of the porch enclosure to better reference a porch railing. Final design to be administratively approved.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

6. [COA-156667-2024](#) 2404 East Clay Street - Construct a second story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Striffler to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The new addition be clad in a horizontal siding rather than panels. Any new exterior mechanical equipment be in the rear and screened from the street and alley. Information on any window replacement be submitted to staff administrative review and approval. Final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

7. [COA-156668-2024](#) 2406 East Clay Street - Construct a second story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The new addition be clad in a horizontal siding rather than panels. Any new exterior mechanical equipment be in the rear and screened from the street and alley. Information on any window replacement be submitted to staff administrative review and approval. Final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

8. [COA-156669-2024](#) 2408 East Clay Street - Construct a second story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The new addition be clad in a horizontal siding rather than panels. Any new exterior mechanical equipment be in the rear and screened from the street and alley. Information on any window replacement be submitted to staff administrative review and approval. Final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

9. [COA-156646-2024](#) 817 North 22nd Street - Construct two semi-attached, three story buildings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Hill to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: A dimensioned door surround and window hoods detail be submitted for chair and vice chair review to ensure that it is proportionately correct to the overall building; Downspouts be rounded. Gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval. The treated wood rails and decks be painted or opaquely stained. Information on the proposed material treatment of recessed entrance and steps be submitted for Administrative Review and approval. Final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

No -- 2 - Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Emily Striffler

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez

10. [COA-156648-2024](#) 2201 Venable Street - Construct a new three story building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Striffler,

to defer this application. The Commission had concerns with the overall design of the building. There was a consensus that the building either needed to read as residential or commercial but was somewhere in between in the submission. The Commission thought there were a few design solutions that could help ground the building on the corner, but the porch included in the design needed to have a depth closer to historic porches of six feet and have more of a presence. Cladding the building in brick was discussed as well as setback. Overall, the main points raised by the Commission were creating a usable porch depth that better reflects the dimensions of historic porches in the district, setback, using architectural elements that address/wrap the corner with a greater presence, materiality, and if it is going to sit on the lot line it needs to be a more substantial building. These elements were all ways that the building design could be revised but it was stated by the commission that all these suggestions may not need to be implemented to create an appropriate design.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

11. [COA-156639-2024](#) 2607 East Marshall Street - Construct a two story semi-attached building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2024-11-26 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Overall, the Commission was supportive of the design and found that it was compatible with the context of the district. There were mixed comments about the appropriateness of the center dormers; some Commissioners finding that there is not enough precedent in the district for their inclusion, and that they were from an architectural style not common in the district (craftsman). Some Commissioners stated that the dormers should all have the same roof form. The Commission also stated that consistency in roof material between the dormer, main roof, and porch roof would be more appropriate. Details on the exterior mechanical, including for accessory buildings, and trash enclosures was requested for the final review.

12. [COA-156640-2024](#) 2609 East Marshall Street - Construct a two story semi-attached building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2024-11-26 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Overall, the Commission was supportive of the design and found that it was compatible with the context of the district. There were mixed comments about the appropriateness of the center dormers; some Commissioners finding that there is not enough precedent in the district for their inclusion, and that they were from an architectural style not common in the district (craftsman). Some Commissioners stated that the dormers should all have the same roof form. The Commission also stated that consistency in roof material between the dormer, main roof, and porch roof would be more appropriate. Details on the exterior mechanical, including for accessory buildings, and trash enclosures was requested for the final review.

13. [COA-155642-2024](#) 2611 East Marshall Street - Construct a two story detached building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2024-11-26 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Overall, the Commission was supportive of the design and found that it was compatible with the context of the district. There were mixed comments about the appropriateness of the center dormers; some Commissioners finding that there is not enough precedent in the district for their inclusion, and that they were from an architectural style not common in the district (craftsman). Some Commissioners stated that the dormers should all have the same roof form. The Commission also stated that consistency in roof material between the dormer, main roof, and porch roof would be more appropriate. Details on the exterior mechanical and trash enclosures was requested for the final review.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:09p.m.