



**Staff Report**  
**City of Richmond, Virginia**



**Commission of Architectural Review**

|                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                          |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| 6. COA-156667-2024                                                                                                                             | Final Review                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Meeting Date: 11/26/2024 |
| Applicant/Petitioner                                                                                                                           | Brian Spencer                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                          |
| Project Description                                                                                                                            | Construct a second story rear addition.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                          |
| Project Location                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                          |
| Address: 2406 East Clay Street                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                          |
| Historic District: Church Hill North                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                          |
| High-Level Details:<br><br>The applicant requests approval to construct a second story, rear, frame addition on a masonry building circa 1900. |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                          |
| Staff Recommendation                                                                                                                           | Approval, with Conditions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                          |
| Staff Contact                                                                                                                                  | Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                          |
| Previous Reviews                                                                                                                               | None.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                          |
| Conditions for Approval                                                                                                                        | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The new addition be clad in a horizontal siding rather than panels.</li> <li>• Any new exterior mechanical equipment be in the rear and screened from the street and alley.</li> <li>• Information on any window replacement be submitted to staff administrative review and approval.</li> <li>• Final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.</li> </ul> |                          |

## Staff Analysis

| Guideline Reference                            | Reference Text                                                                                                                                                                                      | Analysis                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Standards for New Construction, Siting, pg. 46 | <i>1. Additions should be subordinate in size to their main buildings and as inconspicuous as possible. Locating additions at the rear or on the least visible side of a building is preferred.</i> | <p>The proposed addition will be subordinate in size to the primary portion of the building and will be located at the rear.</p> <p>It appears that the existing one-story frame addition is original to the building, or was constructed shortly after</p> |

|                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | the building's construction, as it appears on the 1905 Sanborn Map.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Standards for New Construction, Form, pg. 46               | <i>3. New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches, and front steps into their design. In Richmond, porches were historically an integral part of residential design and provide much of the street-level architectural character of Richmond's historic districts.</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | The proposed rear addition will be simple in design. The existing one-story frame addition will remain which features a door and window. There are not many pedestrian scale elements, as the features on the rear of the building are more utilitarian than pedestrian facing.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Standards for New Construction, Materials & Colors, pg. 47 | <p><i>1. Additions should not obscure or destroy original architectural elements.</i></p> <p><i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</i></p> <p><i>3. Paint colors for new additions should complement the historically appropriate colors used on the primary structure. Paint colors used should be like the historically appropriate colors already found in the district (see Painting Section starting on page 60).</i></p> <p><i>5. Rooftop mechanical equipment should be located as discretely as possible to limit visibility. In addition, appropriate screening should be provided to conceal equipment from view. When rooftop railings are required for seating areas or for safe access to mechanical equipment, the railings should be as unobtrusive as possible, in order to minimize their appearance and visual impact on the surrounding district</i></p> | <p>The addition will be located on the rear and will not obscure any original architectural features.</p> <p>The existing one-story frame addition that the proposed addition will be constructed atop is clad vinyl, wood, and plywood. It is constructed on brick piers. The applicant proposes to add a continuous foundation in this location clad in "antique" brick. The applicant also proposes to remove the existing cladding and to replace it with horizontal 5 ¼ reveal fiber cement siding.</p> <p>The proposed addition will be clad in smooth cementitious panels with boral trim. Trim will be applied in a way that demarcates the original, sloped roof form on the existing one-story addition. There will be a one-over-one aluminum clad wood window on the proposed addition, as well as a skylight and a TPO roof.</p> <p>Staff finds that the material selection is compatible with the district.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the new addition be clad in a horizontal siding rather than panels.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that any new exterior mechanical equipment be in the rear and screened from the street and alley.</u></p> |
| Standards for New Construction, Doors & Windows, pg. 49    | <p><i>1. The size, proportion and spacing patterns of door and window openings on a new addition should follow patterns established by the original building. Windows on most commercial and residential properties throughout Old and Historic Districts have a vertical orientation. Wide, horizontal so-called "picture windows" on new additions are strongly discouraged.</i></p> <p><i>3. The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on free standing, new construction should be compatible with patterns established within the district.</i></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | <p>The proposed addition will have one, one-over-one aluminum clad wood window on the west elevation. Based on the drawings, it appears that the window will be vertically aligned with the existing window below. The is in-keeping with fenestration patterns throughout the district.</p> <p>Staff believes that a one-over-one or a six-over-six window would be appropriate on the proposed addition.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that information on any window replacement be submitted to staff administrative review and approval</u></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |

*It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.*

## Figures

Figure 1. 2404, 2406, and 2408 East Clay Street. Assessor's photo 1950s.



Figure 2. 2404, 2406, and 2408 East Clay Street. Existing condition of facades.



Figure 3. East Elevation. 2408 East Clay Street.



Figure 4. 2404, 2406, and 2408 East Clay Streets' rear elevations of existing additions.



Figure 5. Sanborn Map, 1905. Map show one story frame additions on the rear of 2404, 2406, and 2408 East Clay Street.

