



Commission of Architectural Review

9. COA-178061-2026	Final Review Meeting Date: 1/27/2026
Applicant/Petitioner	William Artiglia
Project Description	Construct a rear two-story addition with a third-story covered porch
Project Location	
Address: 2509 East Franklin Street	
Historic District: St. John's Church	
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes to construct a rear two story addition with a third story roof deck on the rear of a pre-1879, masonry Italianate building.</p> <p>The rear addition will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way as there is not a rear alley.</p>	
Staff Recommendation	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, Alex.Dandridge@RVA.gov, (804)646-6569
Previous Reviews	None.
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The siding be either wood or smooth, unbeaded, fiber cement siding. • Exposed wooden deck and railing elements be painted or stained a color that compliments the building once wood has appropriately weathered. • Windows on the addition be larger, more in-keeping with the size of the existing windows. • Windows on the addition use either a one-over-one pane configuration or a two-over-two pane configuration with simulated divided lights. Windows must be either wood or aluminum clad wood. • The decks on the first and third stories use Richmond Rail rather than the nailed-up pickets. • Decking boards be tongue and groove and installed perpendicular to the face of the building.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Windows on the rear addition be more centered, and equal distances from either side of the rear elevation.
	<p>Revisions and details required for staff approval in a future a subsequent COA application before permit issuance/permission to proceed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Existing and proposed window dimensions ○ Window material and pane configuration ○ Final rear door design and material ○ Final rear elevation showing reconfiguration of rear windows ○ Final decking material and drawing showing board orientation as perpendicular ○ Final exterior color selections

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for new Construction, Siting, pg. 46	<p>1. Additions should be subordinate in size to their main buildings and as inconspicuous as possible. Locating additions at the rear or on the least visible side of a building is preferred.</p> <p>4. If setback waivers or any other waivers are needed, the applicant may petition the Commission to support a Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA) waiver.</p>	<p>The two story addition will be approximately 288 square feet between the two conditioned levels, and an additional 144 square feet on the third story deck. It will be subordinate in size to the primary building.</p> <p>The addition will be located at the rear of the extant building and minimally visible from the public right of way. This is the most inconspicuous location for the proposed addition.</p>
Standards for new Construction, Form, pg. 46	<p><i>3. New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design. In Richmond, porches were historically an integral part of residential design and provide much of the street-level architectural character of Richmond's historic districts.</i></p>	<p>The proposed addition will feature human scale elements such as porches. Staff notes that the addition will not interact with the public right-of-way.</p>
Standards for new construction, Materials & Colors	<p><i>1. Additions should not obscure or destroy original architectural elements.</i></p> <p><i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</i></p> <p><i>3. Paint colors for new additions should complement the historically appropriate colors used on the primary structure. Paint colors used</i></p>	<p>The addition will obscure a some of the original two-over-two windows on the rear of the primary building.</p> <p>The addition will be clad in horizontal lap siding. This siding is compatible with materials found in the district and helps differentiate the addition from the primary historic building. <u>Staff recommends that the siding be either wood or smooth, unbeaded, fiber cement siding.</u></p> <p>Decking elements will be wooden. This material is compatible with the district. Some exposed, wooden, structural elements will be wrapped in PVC. While this</p>

	<p><i>should be similar to the historically appropriate colors already found in the district (see Painting Section starting on page 60).</i></p> <p><i>4. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted for use in City Old and Historic Districts. Other synthetic siding materials with a smooth, untextured finish may be allowed in limited cases, but approval by the Commission is always required.</i></p>	<p>isn't a material that is typically approved, staff finds that it will not be discernable from wood given the height of the deck and limited visibility from the public right-of-way. <u>Staff recommends that exposed wooden deck and railing elements be painted or stained a color that compliments the building once wood has appropriately weathered.</u></p>
<p>New Construction, Doors and Windows, pg. 49</p>	<p><i>1. The size, proportion and spacing patterns of door and window openings on a new addition should follow patterns established by the original building. Windows on most commercial and residential properties throughout Old and Historic Districts have a vertical orientation. Wide, horizontal so-called "picture windows" on new additions are strongly discouraged.</i></p> <p><i>2. The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as models for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should be clear without reflective coatings, to be compatible with original glass.</i></p> <p><i>3. The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on free standing, new construction should be compatible with patterns established within the district.</i></p>	<p>While the proposed addition will obscure some of the existing two-over-two windows, the addition will feature new two-over-two windows.</p> <p>Exact window dimensions were not provided in the application, however; the windows appear to be smaller than the existing windows on the primary building. <u>Staff recommends that the windows on the addition be larger, more in-keeping with the size of the existing windows.</u></p> <p><u>Staff also recommends that the windows on the addition use either a one-over-one pane configuration or a two-over-two pane configuration with simulated divided lights. Windows must be either wood or aluminum clad wood. The following must be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Existing and proposed window dimensions • Window Material • Window pane configuration <p><u>The rear windows on the addition will be set farther toward the west side of the rear elevation. To relate to existing fenestration patterns found in the district, staff recommends that the windows/doors on the rear addition be more centered, and equal distances from either side of the rear elevation.</u></p>
<p>New Construction, Decks, pg. 51</p>	<p><i>Exterior decking is a late 20th-century addition to residential architecture. Suburban in origin, decks are an anomaly in many older neighborhoods. Since owners of historic homes may want to enjoy the benefits of outdoor living, guidelines for the design and installation of decks are provided.</i></p> <p><i>1. Decks should not alter, damage or destroy significant site elements of the property.</i></p> <p><i>2. Decks should complement the architectural features of the main structure without creating a false</i></p>	<p>The addition's third story covered deck and the first story's deck, landing, and stairs appear to feature "nailed-up pickets. The guidelines state that nailed-up pickets are not appropriate for use in historic districts. <u>Staff recommends that the decks on the first and third stories use Richmond Rail rather than the nailed-up pickets.</u> Pickets should be inset into the top and bottom banisters.</p>

historical appearance. Decks should be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure.

3. Deck design may include vertical picket balustrades or contemporary railing that is in scale with the house and the deck.

4. Deck sub-decking should be screened with wood lattice work or with brick piers



Ex of Richmond Rail

The application states that synthetic decking boards will be used on the decks. Staff recommends that the decking boards be tongue and groove and installed perpendicular to the face of the building, final decking material submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1. Existing Conditions of rear where addition will be constructed. Photo taken from within the property. This section of the building is minimally visible from the public right-of-way.