

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
September 26, 2017, Meeting**

14. **COA-023281-2017** (M. Kittrell)

**8-10 East Main Street
Zero Blocks East and West Franklin Street
Old and Historic District**

Project Description:

**Construct a second story addition
on an existing 1-story garage.**

Staff Contact:

M. Pitts

The applicant requests conceptual review and comment on the construction of an addition to an existing garage at the rear of a property in the Zero Blocks East and West Franklin Street Old and Historic District. The primary building is a brick, three-story, Queen Anne multifamily structure build ca. 1895. The existing garage is a single story brick structure with a flat roof with a stepped parapet. The garage was altered in 2003 when the Commission approved the creation of three new vehicular openings in the west elevation. The garage is visible from the adjacent alley and Foushee Street and minimally visible from North 1st Street. There are numerous outbuildings along the subject alley including a two story brick carriage house with a hipped roof immediately across the alley and two 2-story brick carriage houses with flat roofs on the properties to the east of the subject lot.

The applicant came before the Commission on August 22, 2017, for conceptual review of the construction of a second story frame addition which would be clad in board and batten siding and accessible by a set of exterior stairs. The addition had a hip roof clad in asphalt shingles and a shed dormer on the west elevation. Though the Commission was supportive of adding a second story to the existing garage, Commissioners had concerns regarding the proposed design. Commissioners recommended the applicant propose a simplified, contemporary design that was more utilitarian and did not mimic a style.

The applicant has modified the application as follows:

- The board and batten cladding has been replaced with cementitious or synthetic stucco.
- The projecting bay has been reduced in scale.
- The double hung windows have been replaced with casement windows.
- A frame two story addition with a shed roof has been added. The addition will project 11'-6" from the south building wall.

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The Commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only.

Staff has reviewed the proposed structure under the Commission's guidelines for residential additions and residential outbuildings found on pages 46-51 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*. The *Guidelines* note that additions should be subordinate in size to their main buildings and as inconspicuous as possible by being located at the rear of a building (pg. 46, Siting #1). Though the proposed rooftop addition is the same size as the existing garage, it is substantially smaller than the primary structure on the property and is located at the rear of the property. Staff does have concerns that with the proposed frame addition, the new construction to the garage will overwhelm the existing garage. The *Guidelines* note that newly constructed outbuildings should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood (pg. 51, Residential Outbuildings #2). The proposed design mimics the roof form and scale of the carriage house across the alley. Though changes have been made to simplify the materials and design, staff has concerns that by maintaining the hipped roof, the applicant has not addressed the Commission's previous recommendations for a contemporary, utilitarian structure. Though the design incorporates elements of the adjacent carriage house and a similar carriage house at 114 North 2nd Street, the design does not respect the typical utilitarian form of outbuildings in the district including the outbuildings to the east of the subject lot. Staff supports the changes to the windows but recommends that all the windows on the west elevation of the stucco portion of the structure be the same length. Staff also has concerns about how the proposed frame section relates to the brick and stucco portion and recommends the applicant consider utilizing a related roof form and/or materials.

Staff needs the following information for final review of the project:

- Fully dimensioned elevations
- Window and door schedules
- Description of the proposed railing
- Location of mechanical and trash cans on the site plan